Reflections on Musicology and History

Ashok Damodar Ranade

This monograph, 'Maharashtra Art Music' written by Dr. Ashok Da Ranade, is published by Dr. Ashok Da Ranade Memorial Trust, Mumbai in 2022.

This e-edition is published only to make it available to all those interested in this area of research, and hence it is distributed without any price. This monograph should be used only as a reference and any other sort of use (copying, printing, distributing, sale, etc.) is not permitted.

Publication: 2022
Publisher: Dr. Ashok Da Ranade Memorial Trust, Mumbai
Email: adrtrust2018@gmail.com
Website: www.ashokdaranade.org

©Dr. Ashok Da Ranade Memorial Trust, Mumbai

Table of Contents

Part 1

TOWARDS INDIAN MUSICOLOGY

Chapter one
Indian Musicology: The Scholastic Model

Introduction:

Even before joining the battle proper, perhaps I owe an explanation for the title of the Part 1 itself, 'Towards', is a preposition i.e. a word used with a noun or pronoun to mark its relation with another word suggesting for example, its direction or position etc. Therefore, to use the phrase 'Towards musicology' is to point at approaching the discipline or making a movement in its direction. This would thereby imply that as wet one has not arrived at it! The preposition would also point to a land of non-committal position: it merely notes that I propose to talk about a field known as musicology. Finally, the wording carries a shade of meaning, which hints at the desirability of efforts expected to prove conducing to the field; - as if nothing has happened so far which is worthy of note meriting description! This position would of course be presumptuous and I do not hold it. However, I admit that the title is a mild expression of my own (as well as the prevailing) dissatisfaction with the present state of musicology vis-à-vis music in India.

Music in India is changing; in fact, it has been always changing. Has musicology taken adequate cognizance of these changes? As musicology is only one of the music-related disciplines, it has an academic obligation to keep meaningful inter connections with music and related matters. Has it done so? And most importantly, is its conceptual understanding of the discipline and its operative framework successfully keeping pace with the actual musical reality around?

All in all, I promise to raise more and more uncomfortable questions as we go along.

Is the term 'Indian' ambitious?

In the beginning is a dilemma! Given the multiplicity of art-music systems in the country, expectably accompanied by their respective theoretical expositions, the question is: to what extent am I justified in referring to a Pan-Indian backdrop? Is it truer to say that perhaps the pre-medieval period, though not monolithic, might have been musically more homogenous/ cohesive and could have therefore allowed a Pan-Indian approach more justifiably than the later scene in the sub-continent? Having a restricted knowledge of only one prevailing system of art-music, namely, the Hindustani - I can only put down an admission in place of an answer! I do not propose to exhaustively discuss all individual works and to that extent my approach would be general. As a consequence, I hope that my presentation would be relevant at least in some measure to the Indian situation as such, - despite the fact that only at least one system of art music has been kept in view.

Changing Connotations of Musicology:

Today, it has been sincerely argued that, in view of the present state of our knowledge, one can hardly hope to have a Theory of Music or Musicology proper. As a consequence, more culture-specific terms, such as Indian Musicology, are preferred. The usage suggests welcome humility in face of a staggering variety of music-s, of which we are increasingly becoming aware.

There are other reasons (-apart from the sheer multiplicity of unknown/less-known music-s,) for paying more attention to the term Musicology. The term is obviously a late entrant in the arena of music-thought. It is reportedly adapted from the French word 'musicologie', and it is held to be an acceptable equivalent to the German term 'Musikwissenschaft (meaning 'science of music') which is generally taken to mean 'scientific and historical knowledge of music'. In 1885, Guido Adler wrote a very comprehensive 'job-description' for the term! In his German article titled (to mean in translation) 'Scope, Method and Aim of the Science of Music' he virtually indicated the entire range of music-study as the scope of the Science of Music. As envisaged by him, the study included palaeography (musical notation), histories of art-forms, history of composition & instruments, harmony, rhythm, theory, aesthetics, teaching and finally 'musicologie' meaning research. Other equally ambitious descriptions are also available.

For example:

Waldo S. Pratt says, 'Musicology must include every conceivable discussion of musical topics'.

Or, O. Kinkelddey, (the first President of the American Musicological Society, founded in 1934) opines that musicology is, "The whole body of systematized knowledge about music, which results from the application of a scientific method of investigation or research, or of philosophical speculation and rational systematization of facts, the processes and the development of musical art and to the relation of man in general (or even animals) to that art."

Or, H. Lang, says, "Musicology unites in its domains all the sciences which deal with production, appearance & application of the physical phenomenon called sound."[1]

It is instructive to note that lexicographers do not seem to have accorded a general acceptance to the term till 1930-s, and the later definitions only seem to vie with each other in laying claims to more and more territory of musical behaviour - except perhaps the actual performing proficiency. It is therefore safe to conclude that the term certainly invites conceptual re-definition and a matching terminological precision.

It is interesting to note that in Germany, many University-chairs were set up in the name of 'Musical Knowledge' during the first few decades of the nineteenth

---

[1] Apel, Willie. Hardward Dictionary of Music, Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1973 pp. 558-559.

century. Similarly, during the same period, American and European cultures showed keen interest in establishing Musicological Societies. Obviously, there was a felt consensus, a general agreement that more concentration and rigour were required to deal with the non-performing aspects of music.

At the same time, it is not surprising that, during the last hundred years, music-history, study of music-culture relationship, music-aesthetics, musical acoustics etc. have carved out their own, and more or less autonomous areas. Musicology to claim a very wide operational territory in music studies, and other music - related disciplines to assert their own area are obviously two opposing tendencies. The time is therefore ripe to allow a well-defined or re-defined domain of activity for musicology. Despite usual overlaps, a clear statement of its functions, aims and strategies is possible, as well as, desirable. In my opinion, the first easy step is to lend receptive ears to specific cultures in this respect. It is clear that cultures, which make specific music, are also cultures, which study it. For a serious study of non-performing aspects of music, it may therefore be useful to turn to music-practicing cultures themselves to get a definition the field under discussion.

Shastra-s in India: The Indian Scene:

The Indian scene is positively useful. In the first instance, when two important adjectives, namely, 'scientific and systematic' are applied to music, the usage indicates a considerable narrowing of the field related to music-theory. It would appear that the description 'scientific and systematic study of music' would point to what is generally understood as Sangitashastra.

This would naturally mean a considerable reduction in the scope of the term in order to appreciate this reduction in scope, it is necessary to understand the conceptual thrust of the term Shastra. As it happens with many other seminal cultural concepts and terms in India, the term was originally applied to religious and sacred treatises. Soon, however, its connotation was extended to cover many departments of knowledge or science. Thus understood, the term Shastra would point to the whole body of teachings in a concerned subject. Hence, we have formulations such as Vedanta-shastra (metaphysics), Alankara-shastra (rhetorics) and Tarka-shastra (logic) came into circulation. In a near-simultaneous and meaningful movement, Shastra has also been distinguished in Indian thinking from *Prayoga* i.e. performance or practice. To clarify the issue further I suggest that it would be a sound strategy to note the terminological cluster formed around the term 'Shastra'. For example, one favourite term of many writers on Indian music is 'Shastrokta'. It means 'prescribed by sacred laws, enjoined by Shastra-s, lawful and legal'. A very hurting term is शास्त्रगण्डः Shastra-Gandah i.e. 'a superficial reader of books, or a superficial scholar'. Further, interestingly, the term शास्त्रचक्षुः Shastra-chakshuh refers to grammar, which obviously is a tool highly rated in the process of understanding any systematic exposition. A theorist is described as Shastra-Dnya,

Shastra-Darshin or Shastra-Vid (शास्त्रज्ञः, शास्त्रदर्शिन्, शास्त्रविद्). A little more lexicographic exploration rewards us with four more engaging terms likely to be useful while examining the Indian view of musicology. It is stated that shastra-vadah (शास्त्रवाद) means 'a percept or statement of the shastra-s', Shastra-Virodha (शास्त्रविरोधः) indicates 'a mutual contradiction, inconsistency of percept's', Shastra-Varjita (शास्त्रवर्जित) points to something 'free from all rule of law' and Shastra-Vyutpattih (शास्त्रव्युत्पत्ति) con notes 'intimate knowledge, proficiency in shastra-s'. The term shastriya is recorded merely to mean 'scientific'. A term which contains immense historical truth and which registers a rare terminological tribute is: Shastra-Shilpin (शास्त्रशिल्पिन्) meaning 'the shape of Shastra' and it is used to describe Kashmir! Obviously, the homage to the region is justified even if one name, that of Abhinavagupta, is mentioned![2]

Music and Shastra in India:

Even a cursory glance at the long tradition of works on Shastra-s on music in India would reveal that they hardly touch upon the historical aspect of music. As is known, music-history of Hindustani music comes very late on the scene. Students of Indian cultural behaviour are very likely to argue that this is yet another instance of the generally a-historical Indian temperament! It may however be pointed out that biographical information is a legitimate component of historical outlook and almost all musicological works contain it. And yet, it is to be admitted that the recorded information is so meagre that, at the most, it can be accepted as a glimmer and not a vision of history!

Apart from excluding historical view from its range, Indian musicology, through its brilliant array of works during the centuries, displays another act of limiting of its scope. It projects a strong grammatical concern, though occasional allusions to performing and psychological aspects are not avoided. As would be shown at a later stage, generally Indian musicology suggests a very wide framework of exposition, which is almost ethnomusicological in scope, and yet, it mainly succeeds in focussing attention on issues of grammatical import, in order to draw attention to this fact, the concerned tradition is preferably described as scholastic. The word scholastic generally means, 'that which pertains to the scholarly world of erudition, learning etc.' Etymologically, the word 'scholastic' leads us to 'school'. We also get the valuable piece of information that originally the word 'school' meant 'leisure or that which is done during the leisure time'! One can only sigh and pine for the loss of innocence which the shift in meaning of the term school points to!

---

[2] Prin. V. S. Apte's Sanskrit-English Dictionary, ed. Gode, P. K. and Karve, C. G., Prasad Prakashan, Pune, 1979 pp. 1548.

It is obvious and understandable that scholastic tradition has to reckon with compulsions of its own. These compulsions are notably different from those associated with performing tradition. This is the reason why Indian musicology has been consolidated or codified and written in a distinctive manner. Through the mode of organizing the material it opts for, Indian musicology displays affinity towards certain kinds of problems and discusses musical and music-related issues in a specific way. It is here that the term 'model' proves useful as it helps in perceiving the tradition in a proper perspective.

The Shastric Model:

What is a model? Derived from the Latin word 'modus', meaning 'measure', the word model connotes a tentative description of a theory or system that accounts for all of its known properties. It is necessary to remember that a 'model' does not suggest a prescriptive standard or pattern. It is an ideational structure that a living tradition unavoidably generates because the tradition is keen to have a firm - and not rigid - framework to consolidate and stabilize accepted features normally reflecting chief concerns of the related society. It must, however, be acknowledged that as the tradition strengthens, and as the number of contributing works increase, there is a natural tendency to look up to the model as a standard, or an ideal pattern of behaviour, thought etc., which brooks no easy deviation. Later, it is of course possible to introduce new concepts, consider new or additional facts, and on the whole, modify, change or develop the reigning model, provided the model has not taken a prescriptive and unshakable grip as a 'the standard'. If, and when, a model is thus regarded prescriptive, change becomes difficult and repercussions of the fact are felt in every respect. This is the background on which Indian Musicological model is to be discussed.

Indian Sangita Shastra - Model:

At this juncture, it is sobering to note that even if one restricts the count to works in Sanskrit, no less than 121 works can be listed to have a direct bearing on the subject under consideration. The period during which these works appeared extends from 500 BC to 1921 - with Naradiya Shiksha (Narada) and Abhinav Raga Manjari (Vishnusharma) marking the respective boundaries. It must however, be stated that no account or examination of musicological development can be complete unless relevant scholastic efforts in regional languages are taken into consideration. To consider areas covered by Hindustani art music, along with their respective music-literatures, would thus make a heavy demand on anybody keen to map the musicological tradition in its entirety. As many students of Indian culture have stated, there were happenings in the nineteenth century notable in this context. The new English education, advent of the printing press and the new enthusiastic and committed journalism combined with a deep upsurge of nationalism to give impetus

to writing on art music in almost all regional languages. Very often, performers of great repute themselves wrote books, and these works most of the times spring a surprise on readers by their directness of approach, transparency of expression as also by the evident sense of responsibility felt by their authors - who were normally not well educated! Further, if one aims at thoroughness in tracing the tradition, writings on music from the pre-printing days also need to be looked into. Admittedly, these writings are scattered and often they treat music as a side issue and yet they cannot justifiably be ignored. One may conclude that today, whenever possible (and with the due regard for our increasing awareness of differences in cultural dynamics of various Indian regions,) it is advisable to keep in mind that regional musicological literatures must be consulted if the ideal is to aim at completeness of inquiry.

What do the Titles Suggest?

On the background of the foregoing discussion, the nature of the Indian Musicological model, as it emerges in scholastic tradition, is to be examined.

When these works are viewed as a body, their titles are the first feature to attract attention. Titles often proclaim the chief concern of the author - who after all is the main informant in the contemplated exchange, which every devoted reading of a work is supposed to be. Examination of names reveals the following:

a) A majority of works includes the term *Sangita* in the title. This term is then followed by another term intended to connote 'expanse, excellence, high-point of development' etc. Forty-seven of the 121 works employ the term *Sangita* in the first half of the title. In the second half, occur words such as: Amrita (अमृत), Arnava (अर्णव), Bhaskara (भास्कर), Chandra (चंद्र), Chandrika (चंद्रिका), Chandrodaya (चंद्रोदय), Chintamani (चिंतामणि), Chudamani (चुडामणि), Darpana (दर्पण), Kalanidhi (कलानिधी), Kalika (कलिका), Kalpadruma (कल्पद्रुम), Kalpataru (कल्पतरू), Kaumudi (कौमुदी), Makaranda (मकरंद), Manidarpanam (मणिदर्पणम्), Muktavali (मुक्तावलि), Parijata (पारिजात), Pushpanjali (पुष्पांजलि), Raja (राज), Ratnakara (रत्नाकर), Sagara (सागर), Sangrahachintamani (संग्रहचिंतामणि), Sar (सार), Saramrita (सारामृत), Sarani (सारणी), Sarasangraha (सारसंग्रह), Sarkalika (सारकालिका), Saroddhara (सारोद्धार), Sarvasva (सर्वस्व), Shringarhara (शृंगारहार), Sudha (सुधा), Sudhakara (सुधाकर), Sudhanidhi (सुधानिधी), Suryodaya (सूर्योदय), Upanishad (उपनिषद्), Vidyavinod (विद्याविनोद).

b) Very few (in fact, barely seven) titles include authors' names, for example: Naradiya Shiksha, Dattilam, Bharata-natya-shastra, Aumapatam, Sangita-Damodara, Hridaya-kautuka and Hridaya-prakasha.

c) The patron's name figures only in two works, namely Anup-Sangita-vilas and Anup-Sangita-ratnakara (1780) of Bhavabhatta.

d) Quite a few titles refer to specific elements of music such as *Deshi, Raga, Tala, Bhava, Rasa, Mela-Raga, Mela-ang.*

More than sixteen devote attention to raga, five to tala, one each to Bhava, Rang and Rasa respectively. While two works are devoted to Vina, one each to Tala-Vadya-s and Mridang are noted. Titles focussing on Natya or Nritya, or those declaring allegiance to another work or author (e.g. Bharata Natyasahstra, Sangita Ratnakara) also appear.[3]

The Major Musicological Orientations:

The titles were specially examined because, as has already been suggested, they indicate the particular thrust of the work. The rhetorical question, "what is in name?" may not be valid in this context! The titles appear to underscore the need to distinguish between four major preoccupations or orientations of Indian musicological works. They are:

1) Compilation of authorities
2) Discussion of scientific Issues
3) Offering the help in actual practice of the art and
4) Grammar.

It is true that major works often combine the four and yet, there are numerous cases where there is a marked concentration on one or the other orientation. Another important feature is that the works generally tend to keep a close link with poetics. Frequently, streams of musicology and poetics run parallel and the titles invariably reflect the fact. A brief discussion of the four orientations would be in order and it would be taken up after some more ground is covered.

---

[3] Desai, Chaitanya, Sangitvishayak Sanskrit Grantha, Suvichar Prakashan Mandal, Nagpur, 1979.

Chapter Two
The 20th Century

The 20th Century and the Final Narrowing of Musicology:

It must be admitted that it is the present century, which finally narrowed the scope of musicology by restricting *Sangita* to vocal music. The progressive near disappearance of *Nritya* and *Vadya* from musicological works is symptomatic of the superiority ascribed to vocal music over the other two cognate entities. It is conjectured that largely extra-musical and notably socio-cultural reasons are responsible for the comparative lower placement of instrumental music and dance. The aphoristic Hindi remark, in wide circulation even today, confirms the observation. It is said: *Uttam Gana, Madhyam Bajana, Kanishtha Nachna (aur Bikat Batana)!* The saying however does not appear to have a prestigious ancestry in the tradition.

It is common knowledge that works of the repute of Sangita Ratnakara, Sangita Chudamani, Sangita Samay-saar devote separate chapters to dance, a few also to drama which, as we know, was initially dance-oriented to a greater extent. It is necessary to note that one of the obvious reasons for the scarcity and late appearance of independent treatises on dance is its earlier inclusion in, and later exclusion from, the Sangita tradition. The musicological exclusion of dance and drama from Sangita and the low placement of the former in the hierarchy - are a modern phenomenon that runs counter to the traditional interpretation of Sangita. It would not be an exaggeration to say that this narrowing down has been mainly due to Pt. V. N. Bhatkhande's extremely focussed and systematic exposition of the discipline in the modern period.

The Traditional, Ethnomusicological Framework:

It would not be an overstatement to say that the traditional musicological position was nearly ethnomusicological in intention and actuality to a remarkable extent. It is observed that, a majority of works does not proceed to discuss the technical issues of musicology without outlining the entire cultural framework at the outset. For instance, in Sangita Ratnakara, the first chapter devotes 167 Sloka-s to deal with the 'themes' of Ishwara (God), Jeeva (being), Jeevotpatti (origin of a being) Garbhotpatti (origin of an embryo), three basic body humours and various chakra-s in human body. 'Abhilashitartha - Chintamani athava Manasollasa', yet another important text which has a strong recreational bias-discusses numerous other cultural aspects along with music. Army and its divisions, merits of a king,

administration of state, taxation, diamonds and rubies, miracles and medicines, recipes, wines, games etc. find place in it.

Briefly, it must be noted that awareness of musical categories is an important indicator of an ethnomusicological vision. This is brought to our notice in different ways. For example, Bharata, laid down a dictum that there cannot be a melodic, fundamental framework consisting of less than four notes, but does not fail to mention that in Apakrishta...... Dhruva... this can be so. And more informative is Matanga in Brihaddeshi. He states that clans such as Shabara, Pulinda, Kambhoj, Vanga, Kirat Balhik, Andhra and Dravid practice music of this kind. Is this not a musicological cognizance of the category of primitive music?[4]

Or in another interesting instance: Manasollasa pointedly refers to the playing of *trivali* drum 'to accompany inebriated professional woman's seductive dances'. Is this not popular music? In the same work, the description of techniques of storytelling includes references to the necessary instrumental accompaniment - and the description can surely lead us to many contemporary folk forms. Similarly, the author, Someshwara talks of 'miracles', which however turn out to be magic-shows! This extended connotation of performing arts can hardly be missed. Manasollasa and such other works are not isolated examples. In other words, Indian musicology seems to have begun its course with a model which displayed an ethnomusicological range. However, a progressive narrowing of its scope restricted the model firstly to three performing arts. The second narrowing saw it confined to vocal music, instrumental music and dance combined sometimes with drama. And, finally it has reached a point where all musical thinking seems to have been restricted to vocal art music! This, in my opinion, is a factor that has certainly impaired Indian musicological vision.

Scientific Literature: The Sanskrit Formats:

Is it possible that models perfected by the vast body of Sanskrit scientific literature proved too rigid to allow enthusiastic ethnomusicological formulations? In this context it may help to take into consideration the established genres of technical literature in the Sanskrit tradition. For example, Sutra, Bhashyam, Kosha, Nirukta, Nighantu, Nibandha, and Teeka should come to mind. A careful perusal of Indian musicological works would bring out repeated, deliberate and fruitful recourse to one, or many of these varieties of ratiocination. Authors' intentions become more fathomable when structures and rationale of formats employed by them are properly appreciated.

To get the maximum from a work, the following, and similar other questions become relevant and they need to be asked. Does the author consider a particular

---

[4] Quoted by Desai, Chaitanya, Sangitvishayak Sanskrit Grantha, Suvichar Prakashan Mandal, Nagpur, 1979 p.151.

idea notably valuable? Is he inclined to refer to it as an assumption? Is he aware of the antecedents of the idea and does he wish to bring them into consideration? Perhaps brief descriptions of these would make the point clear. These modes or moulds were well entrenched in the tradition of Sanskrit Learning and were profitably used to organize technical information etc.

Kosha

कुश्(ष्) आधारादौ घञ्कर्तरि अच् वा

Kosha is a collection of rare words or significations for the use of poets. The words are all versified; alphabetical order is entirely absent in the synonyms and it is only incipient in the homonymous class. It is to be noted that Kosha-s in Prakrit languages are also noteworthy. Musical terminology in circulation always needs to be examined to decide whether a term is Tatsama (as in Sanskrit usage), Tadbhava (born out of Sanskrit usage) or Deshaja (entirely from the non-Sanskrit tradition).

The following brief listing of Kosha-s may prove instructive:

No.	Name	Author	Period
1.	Anekartha-samuccaya	Sasvata	Before 500 AD
2.	Amara-kosha	Amara	500 AD
3.	Abhidhan-ratnamala	Halayudha	950 AD
4.	Vaijayanti	Yadava-Prakasha	1050 AD
5.	Trikhanda-shesh (supplement to Amara)	Purushottmadeva	1300 AD
6.	Moukhakosha (Composed in kashmir)		1300 AD
7.	Abhidhan-chintamani (synonyms)	Hemachandra	1088-1172 AD
8.	Anekartha-Sangraha	-do-	-do-
9.	Deshi-nama-mala	-do-	-do-
10.	Nighantu-shesha	-do-	-do-

Sootra

It is a formulation, which aphoristically and concisely states rules. It is defined as: अल्पाक्षरमसंदिग्धं सारवत् विश्वतोमुखम् । अस्तोभमनवद्य सूत्रं सूत्रविदो विदुः ॥

'That which does not create doubts in spite of having a few letters, that which contains the core of the argument and remains useful and corresponding even elsewhere in the works, and that which is not tarnished by superfluity and grammatical mistakes - that is called *Sootra*'.

Sootra is usually metrical. It is also accompanied by *Vritti*, a short explanatory comment. Metrically well-constructed Sootra is known as Karika. It is instructive to note that Karika is further defined as 'a memorial verse, or a collection of such verses on grammatical, philosophical or scientific subjects'.

Vartika

It is defined as 'a work written as a commentary i.e. an explanatory work on a Sootra. However, a more spelt out meaning creates room for contribution of the Vartika-kar. It states that Vartika is in fact: उक्तानुक्तदुरूक्तार्थव्यक्तिकारि तु वार्तिकम् ।

'An explanatory or supplementary rule which explains the meaning of that which is said, or of that which is left unsaid, or of that which is imperfectly said, or a rule which explains what is said or but imperfectly said and supplies omissions'.

As the term was originally applied to Katyayana's explanatory notes on Panini's Sootra-s, Vartika continued to have a narrow association. However, its application need not, and cannot be restricted to grammar of language. For example, it has been aptly pointed out that Kavyaprakasha of Mammata (1100 AD) is in fact a Vartika on Dhvanyaloka of Anadvardhana (850 AD). Very often Vartika could mean verses followed by explanatory prose.

Bhashyam

भाष् = 'speaking or talking'. The term is perhaps the best example of how the scholastic tradition evolved explanatory procedures and literatures to meet heavy demands made on students by the growing body of literature. Thus, apart from drawing attention to the user-friendly processes of speaking and talking, the term also denotes works in common or vernacular language. This is the sense in which Dnyneshvari is a Bhashyam on Shri Madbhagwatgeeta. However, there is another aspect to its functions which is stated thus:

सूत्रार्थो वर्ण्यते यत्र पदैः सुत्रानुसारिभिः । स्वपदानि च वर्ण्यन्ते भाष्यं भाष्यविदो विदुः ॥
'A commentary, which explains Sootra-s word by word with comments of its own, is Bhashyam.' Or, as in Shishupalavadha:

संक्षिप्तस्याप्यतोऽस्यैव वाक्यस्यार्थगरीयस: । सुविस्तरतरा वाचो भाष्यभूता भवन्तु ते ॥

Nirukta

This is one of the most important modalities developed in the scholastic tradition. It means 'derivation or an etymological interpretation'. Nirukta-shastra has been regarded as a science complementary to Vyakarana - a fact important to note in our discussion. It has been rightly pointed out in rhetoric that very often it constitutes an artificial explanation of the derivation of a word. Thus defined it means:

निरूक्तिर्योगतो नाम्नामन्यार्थत्वप्रकल्पनम् । ईदृशैश्चरितैर्जाने सत्यं दोषाकारो भवान् ॥
(दोषाकर: = दोषाणामाकर:)

However, this is what Niruktam means as a noun. The core of the meaning of the term is in its adjectival form, where it refers to that which is expressed, explained or defined. Interestingly, the word Nirukta also means 'loud, distinct'. 'Niruktam' as an etymological explanation has been very succinctly described (in the Cahndogya Upanishad 8.3.3):

सवा एष आत्मा हृदि तस्यैतदेव निरुक्तं हृदयम् ।

It is helpful to remember that originally Niruktam was one of the six integral parts of the Vedic studies developed to provide glossarial explanations of obscure words occurring in the Veda-s. Such glossaries are known as Nighantu-s and sage Yaska prepared them.

An interesting principle of the Nirukti-followers was their view that all names are derivable from verb-roots and that no name is unexplainable if this procedure is applied. The underlying belief is more important. If and when a word is etymologically explained i.e. when the root is identified, the idea expressed by that word comes under the control of the user. Further, the Brahmana-literature, which invariably noted etymologies, also held the position that there is always a cause for creation of a word (this philosophical position is known as Nidanvada).

Even though Voltaire mockingly said, "Etymology is a science in which vowels count for nothing and the consonants for little" the utility of the approach can hardly be questioned. A more balanced Jespersen notes, 'Etymology tells us nothing about the things, nor even about the present meaning of a word, but only about the way in which a word has come into existence.'

In my opinion, the discipline certainly brings to attention the essential dynamism of the performing phenomenon by making available for analysis features which are culturally accepted but have been changing. It is instructive to know that the word 'etymology', in itself, is etymologically traced back to the Greek word etymos which means 'true'! Obviously, there is cross-cultural evidence to suggest that mankind has held this science of searching for history of words in high regard.

There is a variant of etymology called 'popular etymology'. In it utterance of a word is slightly distorted in order to make the meaning or its main thrust a little more accessible. (e.g. asparagus = sparrow-grass, Sarangi = sou rangi).

Samhita

सहन् = to unite closely together, join together.

With Samhita, one perhaps moves to the most secular and a more generalized modality of bringing together facts etc. It means 'systematically arranged collection or texts or verses.' The term obviously indicates a specific and accepted traditional approach and hence we have the ancient Manusamhita. Originally the

term was applied to the continuous hymnal text of the Veda as formed from the Pada-s or individual words by effecting proper phonetic changes etc. according to the conventions followed by different Sakha-s or schools. Hence, a continuous reading of the text is described as Samhita while a disjointed one, i.e. a reading in which every individual word i.e. Pada is pronounced distinctly, is identified as Pada-patha. The meaning, as well as the usage of the words has undergone many changes - as is the case with the word Shastra.

Nibandha

नि + बन्ध् = to bind, fasten, chain or fetter.

The term is today translated as 'an essay' - meaning a short literary composition. I feel that the word was better understood in the nineteenth century India and was therefore used to refer to a long, well-structured presentation of arguments on a particular theme. This was not far from its original thrust. As has been impressively noted:

प्रत्यक्षरश्लेषमयप्रबन्धविन्यासवैदग्ध्यनिधिनिबन्धं चक्रे।

Teeka

टीक् टिकते to move, go, resort to. टीक्यते गम्यते ग्रन्थार्थोऽनया।

The last major modality which Indian musicology has employed also displays a secular bias. Teeka connotes commentary or a gloss. Whether in case of Mallinatha, the 14th century commentator of Kalidasa or the 15th century Kallinatha, the chief commentator of Sharangdeva, Teeka as a format exemplifies a text dealing with a specific work so comprehensively as to throw light on an entire age. Abhinavagupta in the earlier period stands out for his exemplary achievement in this genre.

Four Orientations

Discussion has now reached a stage where it will be beneficial to take a close look at the four musicological orientations mentioned earlier.

The scholastic model of Indian musicology is built on the foundation prepared by modalities finalized to perfection in the durable Sanskrit-Prakrit tradition all over the country. I am of course referring to the four musicological functions so consistently favoured in the tradition. These have resulted in: a) manual, b) compilation, c) grammar, d) treatise. There are of course overlaps and yet the four functions can hardly be mistaken for one another.

Manuals are Shiksha-s, compilations are Samgraha-s and treatises can be called Tatvagrantha-s while grammars are Vyakarana-s. It is to be remembered that the title of a work cannot always be expected to reflect the major orientation of the work. The overall aim of the complete work, as also of the sections thereof, needs to be examined in this respect. These four orientations are evident in the entire musicological tradition - irrespective of period, language or system of music involved. According to the function he selects, an author opts to discuss or describe, assume or explain, allude or state in detail.

How does one determine orientation of a particular work or a section thereof? I submit that if information gathered from, and about the work, is examined to see how it relates to the following twenty-six items, it should be possible to determine the bias.

1. Title, author, period.
2. Authorities, commentators etc. referred to.
3. Works mentioned and quoted from.
4. Author's region/place.
5. Musical forms dealt with and their nature.
6. Embellishments described.
7. Listed Merits (of singing, instrument-playing etc.)
8. Listed Demerits (of singing, instrument-playing etc.)
9. Voice-qualities, instrumental tones described.
10. Instructions noted for self-study.
11. Instrument mentioned, special techniques for playing identified.
12. Musicians mentioned
13. Mentioned Tala-s
14. Mentioned Raga-Swara-Grama-Sruti- etc.
15. Mentioned non-musical arts
16. Mentioned dance-forms
17. Mentioned non-art music-s
18. Mentioned non-art-instruments
19. Importance of artists, audience
20. Benefits /adverse effects of music
21. Prosodic moulds
22. Reference to femininity and women
23. Professional castes/performers
24. On language and literature
25. Schools, styles, Gharana-s
26. Music and colour, time etc.

Now a little about the nature of the four functions.

Formats and functions:

The First Orientation: Shiksha

Manual or Shiksha (शिक्ष् = to acquire knowledge.) The purpose of the early Shiksha-s was to impart instruction to reciters about pronunciation and intonation of sacred texts, namely mantra and brahmana-s. However, the connotation also extends to include teaching-learning activities in other fields. Therefore, Shiksha, which was one of the six original 'vedanga' - soon became a format applicable to disciplines ranging from military science to music. It may be added that Shiksha and Pratishakhya together throw light on the ancient music-related sound-behaviour. Broadly, it can be stated that while Shiksha deals with the acoustic i.e. sound-production aspect, Pratishakhya attends to phonetics i.e. utterance in a specific linguistic-literary tradition.

An interesting and relevant example is provided by poetics, which does not overlook the Shiksha aspect. It is symptomatic that the early name of poetics was Kriya-kalpa i.e. Kavya-kriya-kalpa (Kamasutra, Vatsyayana, 300 AD). Even later, Bhamaha in 600 AD referred to the art of making poetry i.e. Kavya-kriya. Another well-known authority in poetics, Vamana (600 AD) also dwelt extensively on themes such as authenticity of words, proper time for poetry. He also discussed 20 merits and 22 demerits of poetry. It is instructive to note that this kind of treatment of various themes related to 'making' is aptly described in poetics as Kavishiksha. This is the reason why one so often comes across lines/quotations possessing a notable power or force of an injunction or an instruction circulating in literary studies for centuries. An of quoted line from Vamana is, for example, नैकं पदं प्रयोज्यं प्राणेय|

It is not surprising that while tracing development of poetics experts have very often pointed out that the manual aspect remained prominent during early phases. In the next phase this aspect came to be replaced by the Lakshana (characteristics) phase. This phase, in turn, gave way to a phase when specific rules etc. governing embellishments and their use were given prominence. At this stage, need for a wider conceptual framework was felt as all the earlier phases were to be accommodated being parts of the same living tradition. Thus the march of poetics continued. The argument is not put forward to suggest that music and musicology in India did/ought to follow literature and poetics. The purpose is to stress the fact that the manual-format and its structuring function are inevitable components of growing traditions in art and related thinking.

Indian cultural patterns evince a belief in establishing correspondences between specific fields of expression, study etc., and diurnal and seasonal cycles. The manual-aspect of Indian musicology reflects this feature well. therefore, precise instructions are given about 'when, where, how, why, who and for whom' aspects of study and music making.

I want to argue that the manual aspect, is a format ingrained in the Indian culture and hence, its use in other vocations is logical. An important corroboration is available.

In Kautilya's Arthashastra (400 AD) an ideal daily routine is prescribed for a king and it is described as Rajacharya (royal /regal routine). According to it, the day-night cycle is divided into 16 parts and tasks to be carried out in each are noted in detail. Significantly, a Maharashtra-born literary theoretician, Rajashekhara in his Kavyamimasa (900-925 AD), follows Kautilya and lays down a routine for a poet. In his exposition of the theme of Kavyakarana (making of poetry), and while discussing Abhyasa (study), he describes Kavi-charya. Dividing days and nights into four parts each, Rajshekhara goes on to actually prescribe what a poet should do in these specific time-spans. The schedule laid down is both exhaustive and exhausting! Nothing is left to chance! When it is remembered that Ayurveda i.e. 'the science of longevity' also dwells on Din-charya (daily routine) and Ritu-charya (Seasonal routine), the cohesive and comprehensive thought-pattern followed in Indian culture becomes noticeable.

Shiksha-s deal with teaching-learning procedures and processes expected to prepare and equip persons for actual performance. To that extent the Shiksha-function is performance-related and yet, obviously, it is a pre-performance phenomenon.

Naradiya shiksha is a prominent example of the Manual format in the tradition.

The Second Orientation: Samgraha

Derived from the root meaning (सं+ग्रह), 'to collect, accumulate, gather or hoard'. The term has two intertwined meanings. One usage is customarily described for example, as compilation. The other, less known meaning refers to the epitomizing, summarizing process involved in Samgraha. This, Samgraha-shloka is a verse expected to summarize what has been mentioned before. Therefore, in the present context, Samgraha would mean 'bringing together the earlier and relevant authorities as also to summarize their positions on various issues.' In the contemporary situation, however anthologies of Bandish-s etc. appear to exemplify the term Samgraha on account of their nature and function.

The Third Orientation: Vyakarana

Derived from व्या+कृ, it means 'to make manifest, clear up'. Separation, division and analysis are mentioned as related processes. (Interestingly, we are told that for Buddhists, Vya + kri means to predict future births!). The derived noun, Vykaranam

means analysis and grammatical analysis in particular. Some other strands of the meaning, such as explaining, expounding and discrimination are also attached to the term. Originally, Vyakarana formed one of the six Vedanga-s. Etymology or word-derivation is significantly described as Vyakarana-prakriya i.e. as one of the procedures adopted by Vyakarana. Words and therefore language are logically the main concerns of Vyakarana. Hence an easy derivation therefore reads:

व्याक्रियते शब्दा अनेन इति व्याकरणम्

Another name of Vyakarana is Shabdanushasana, describing the function as 'regulating, governing words in order to bring about Shabda-siddhi'. It is thus expected to instruct us in the correct use of words. All words have a natural tendency, which the Vyakarana takes into consideration to construct a descriptive model of their behaviour. As a discipline related to the Veda-s, Vyakarana obviously came into being after the Veda-s. Its description as Veda-mukha i.e. 'mouth of the Veda-s' clearly refers to its expressive power. I suggest that a brief description of chief purposes and functions of Vyakarana would lead us to a better understanding of Indian musicology because the core of the latter is grammatical. As originally stated functions of Vyakarana make its Vedic application obvious, I intend to briefly describe them along with a musical context. It is natural that because of the innate connections between grammar and musicology in India the contextual substitution does not prove difficult.

The primary and minimal unit in Vyakarana is a word, while in music it is the musical sound. Once this is realized, many grammatical procedures and a number of related philosophical issues are easily understood.

Some Parallels between Grammatical and Musicological Functions:

Vararuchi and Patanjali have noted the main purposes of Vyakaranadhyayana, (i.e. the learning of Vyakarana). These same could be profitably paraphrased as musicological functions as shown below:

Raksha: रक्षा. Preservation. Musicology is to preserve music.

Uha: ऊह. To bring into being new Pada-s i.e. individual musical components to serve as building blocks.

Agama: आगम. Standard. To create a standard through the inherited musical corpus.

Laghuta: लघुता. It is impossible to study and know every authentic musical expression or unit. However, musicological studies provide a way, a short cut because these studies employ 'authenticity' as a concept, thus allowing an easy movement of the mind to new or additional instances of authenticity.

Asandeha: असंदेह. Musicology removes doubts and ambiguities in musical usage.

Apabhransha: अपभ्रंश. Musicology lays down relevant rules in order to prevent the incorrect use and distortion of musical units.

Dushtashabda: दुष्टशब्द. It makes possible the knowledge of what is correct and what is not.

Arthadnyana: अर्थज्ञान. It makes us understand the meaning of music.

Dharmalabha: धर्मलाभ. It gives us benefits of holding together, sustaining a musical culture.

So pervasive is the grammatical bias from Bharata to Bhatkhande that it does not seem necessary to discuss any specific work to emphasize the Vyakarana-orientation. In spite of overlaps with other functions, and arresting variation in authorial intensities, Vyakarana forms a main orientation of Indian musicology, the more so as we move to the modern period so forcefully exemplified by Pt. Bhatkhande and his followers.

It is common knowledge that Vyakarana in India developed along philosophical lines in aspects such as meaning, logic etc. As a consequence, this philosophical leaning also influenced the content of musicology. It is no exaggeration to say that Vyakarana, though apparently had 'words' as its chief concern, very soon it developed and propounded a world-view. One special reason for this expansive stance is not far to seek. The processes of communication wheather in life and art could not do without a recourse to language (-and therefore to Vyakarana-), at one level or the other. Accordingly, these, larger interests of Vyakarana also found outlets in aesthetic approaches to music. Soon they claimed attention in their own right. Discussion of philosophical and aesthetic issues found place in musicology and the 'treatise -function' (as described later) moved in as a ruling function. This is why musicological works often appear to proceed by assuming certain positions on questions of philosophical and aesthetic import. This act of giving weight-age to certain positions (to the exclusion or diminution of others) but not to discuss them or explain the reasoning behind them is logical. It is clear that the main, grammatical thrust may be weakened if historical, aesthetic and such other orientations were also to be allowed more scope.

The Fourth Orientation: Treatise

Treatise or Tatvagrantha is the fourth orientation to be discussed. Tatva is explained as 'a true state or condition'. However, the core meaning, as it emerges through the terminological cluster. points to 'elements, primary substances and true principles'. Tatvadnyana is therefore explained as 'knowledge of truth' as well as 'a

thorough knowledge of the principles of a science'. In the contemporary age of 'fast-paced' music it is a sobering piece of information that Tatvam also means 'slow time' in music! This is the context in which the treatise-dimension or orientation of Indian musicology is to be appreciated.

Besides stating first principles of a particular field of knowledge - in the present case it being music - it may be useful to raise a question: what other tasks are carried out by musicological treatises?

Firstly, a treatise tries to take in its range all aspects of music - manifestations. Secondly, it attempts to arrive at evaluation. Thirdly, it does not rest content by putting down conclusions. The endeavour is to record the entire process of arriving at conclusions.

Chapter Three
The Treatises

The Way of Treatises

Musicological treatises follow an overall strategy primarily directed, towards musical material and secondarily, to other disciplines falling within the purview of the larger scholastic tradition. This strategy determines the content, as well as, the manner of presentation in a treatise. Some of the major sootra-s explicating the overall strategy can be easily identified thus:

लक्ष्यानुसारि लक्षणम् = The distinguishing characteristics are stated on the basis of the contemporary, living tradition of music.

It has been already suggested that musicology moves from Shiksha i.e. the manual phase of development to the lakshana-phase in which chief or distinguishing features are identified for further classification and systematization. The characteristics are singled out from the body of musical material available at the time of musicological formulation. In other words, the characteristics cannot be assumed to have an all-time, all-place validity. It is obvious that discussion of characteristics and arguments that accompany it would become unintelligible if both were not placed in the larger perspective suggested by the actual musical material in circulation. It needs to be stressed in this context that in India a gap between scholastic and performing traditions is ever present and all responsible musicologists from Sharangdeva to Bhatkhande have attempted to bridge it. Because of thenherent respective natures of music-performance and scholastic formulation, the gap can never be completely closed but it can always be considerably narrowed. It is on this background that the present Sootra seems to be of profound significance- as it provides insight into the relative dynamics of two musical streams of a larger tradition. If this Sootra is understood it would be difficult to level charges of obscurity, irrelevance, incorrectness etc. against works of the earlier phases of culture! Reading of earlier musicological works can certainly become a fruitful activity instead of a taxing exercise in burning the midnight oil if the import of this Sootra is appreciated!

The second strategic Sutra is: प्राधान्येन व्यपदेशा भवन्ति, i.e. 'entities are known or named after the major ones'. In a shorter form, the Sutra is stated as प्रधानवस्तु व्यपदेश|

Every Shastra is constituted of major concepts as well as minor or derived concepts. Many procedures, processes and theories are discussed with reference to major concepts. These are expectably valid also in case of minor concepts. Under the

circumstances, minor concepts are assumed to have been subsumed in the major concepts for purposes of theoretical exposition. In other words, application of theories etc. is not demonstrated separately in case of minor concepts. The strategy makes for conciseness. For example, what is discussed with reference to laya, would not be argued separately and again about Tala.

Sutra for the third strategy is: यथोत्तरं मुनीनां प्रमाणम् - 'Later authorities are to be taken as the standard'.

Musicology and other disciplines evolve over a number of centuries. Those who deal in depth with musicological problems take care to see what has been already said by earlier authorities before launching one's own theories! (At least they are expected to do so!) Hence, the later authorities could be assumed to indicate the latest and the standard position accepted by the scholar-performer community.

The fourth strategy is: सिद्धपरमतानुवाद. It means, 'to follow the proofs established in other disciplines, by other authorities.[5]

Musicology discusses issues, which have an intrinsic relationship with grammar, philosophy, Ayurveda, logic etc. These and other disciplines arrive at many conclusions, provide many proofs and develop many approaches likely to be helpful in furthering the musicological cause. Musicology therefore relies on such non-musicological authorities and accepts their conclusions, etc., without entering into a fresh inquiry of its own. This kind of reliance is intelligible only when the referent traditions are also part of a living cultural whole. Obviously, these 'alluding, allusive musicological expositions might appear evasive, obscure, irrelevant' etc. if researchers are not aware of the referent traditions and the natural/ logical musicological strategy of relying on them is not appreciated.

Sampradaya

It could be submitted that one of the most important characteristic and cumulative result of contributions of modalities, orientations and strategies is the creation of Schools or Sampradaya-s in musicology.

Sampradaya, (सं+प्रद् = to give, grant, bestow or confer on). Further, it also means 'to hand down by tradition'. From these explanations, it is but a short step to the connotation linked to systematization of doctrine irrespective of the field under discussion. It would therefore appear that Sampradaya, in its core meaning, refers to a handing over of a traditional doctrine systematized through a long usage.

---

[5] I am indebted for this line and reasoning and development orientations to Bharatiya Sahityashastra, Deshpande, G. T., Popular Prakashan, Mumbai 1963.

On this background, it should be easy to note the following as chief features of Samprdaya:

1) Generations Contribute to its emergence and form.

2) Sampradaya-s can exist as mutually exclusive systems i.e. they are self-sufficient, micro-universes.

3) Different Sampradaya-s may differ even in essentials.

4) Simultaneous existence of sampradaya-s invariably generates dialectical processes.

Perhaps the way Kallinath, the well-known commentator of Sangita Ratnakara, explained the concept might be useful to reach the essence of a performance-oriented Sampradaya - as it is bound to be in music. In translation his explanation reads, 'Sampradaya is the passing on, handing over (of knowledge) through the Guru-Shishya tradition of that which is not (explicitly) said in the Shastra but which is not contradictory to it, and which is in other words could be the result or the essence of the Shashtra'.[6]

Some Case-studies

At this juncture it would perhaps be helpful if case studies of some works of musicological import were presented. It would be, in a manner of speaking, musicological analysis in action!

It is advisable to select examples of diverse kinds to make the analysis as broad-based as possible and to validate the general thrust of the exposition put forward so far. With this view, an ancient manual, four musicological works from the modern period and some material usually classified as 'folk' are selected for the exercise. The sampler could of course be considerably broadened; the geographical distribution or chronological periods can also be chosen more purposefully. As it stands the case-analysis is intended to be illustrative with no claim to exhaustive statement of the position argued about.

Naradiya Shiksha

Earlier, twenty-six items were listed as a help to determine the orientation of a musicological work. It would be instructive to note selected items from the Naradiya Shiksha under the headings identified in the list. Headings under which no items are detected are not mentioned. The bare listing is only intended to clarify the aspect of orientation of musicological material discussed earlier.[7]

01) Title, Author and Period: Naradiya Shiksha / Narada 500 AD.

---

[6] Brihaspati, Acharya K.C. Bharat Ka Sangit Sidhhant; Publications Division, Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow, 1959, pp. 24-25.

[7] I have relied on the following edition: Naradiya Shiksha, Bhise, Usha R. Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Pune, 1986.

02) Authorities, Commentators etc. referred to. Also Names of commentators of the work: Bhatta Shobhakara has written a *Teeka*. Narayanswami Dixit has included it in a compilation called Praksah.

03) Musical Forms and their nature: Discusses Samik swara - till the 7th Kandika of the first Ashtaka. In the Ashtama kandika, Rk - notes are discussed. In the second Ashtaka, the theme is phonetics of the material. The main theme of the exposition is recitation of Sama-s. In the second Ashtaka, which deals with phonetic nuances, an interesting classification of utterance is indicated, - the device described is to make utterances 'musical' through prolongation of different parts of a syllable. Thus four vritti-s or Vivarana-s are realized by investing syllables with certain Upadhi-s. They are: Vatsaka (the initial letter of the earlier Pada is short, and the initial letter of the later Pada is long), Vatsanusarini (the earlier letter is long and the latter is short), Pakavati (initial and final syllables of both the Pada-s have short syllables), Pipilika (both the earlier and later Pada-s to have long initial syllables) (56-4-1,8). Two instructions (which appear to have some relevance even today!) are given by using interesting analogies. Stressing that in Samaveda one cannot jump from one note to the other, we are told, 'one should proceed from one note to the other as a shadow recedes when sunlight advances? (34-7-18). In another place we are told how sweet an utterance should be, 'an utterance should be as sweet as when a Gurjar woman pronounces the word 'araan' (58-4-9). Characteristics of Taan, Raga, Swaragrama and Murchhana are also given (2-2-10).

04) Merits (of singing, instrument playing, etc.): Ten merits are described:
1) Rakta = to be one (Ekabhava) with the Vina, Venu etc.,
2) Poorna = full articulation of Sruti, Chanda, Swara and Patakshara,
3) Alankrita = activating the three Sthana-s of Ur, Shir and Kantha,
4) Prasanna = unhesitantand (apagatagadgada?),
5) Vyakta = uttered in a such a way as to make it clear to the listener,
6) Vikrishta = clarity of articulation even at high pitches,
7) Shlakshana = prolongation according to the tempi such as Druta, Vilambita and Madhya,
8) Sama = to keep a balance between Avapa (incomplete pronunciation) and Nirvapa (inadequacy) in accordance with the prevalent customs,
9) Sukumara = to pronounce without grinding teeth etc.,
10) Madhur = with the inherent lyrical qualities (Padavarnalalitya) of the notes (3.5,10.15-17).

05) Demerits (of singing, instrument-playing, etc.): Fourteen demerits in singing and six specific faults in sustaining a note are described.
1) Shankit = doubtful, uncertain, tentative,
2) Bheet = affected by fear,
3) Uddhristha = excessively forceful/forced/ excited,
4) Avyakta = indistinct,
5) Anunasik = nasalized,
6) Kakaswara = produced by squeezing the throat,
7) Shirasigatam (attyuchha) = too high, placed in the head,
8) Sthanavivarjita = misusing the resonator,

9) Visvara = employing the incorrect swara,
10) Virasa = getting uninvolved in mid-singing,
11) Vishlishta = incorrectly separating two parva-s (sections) in recitation,
12) Vishamahata = incorrectly stressed,
13) Vyakula = imbalanced employment of Varna, Swara etc.,
14) Talaheena = loosing tempo or Taluheena = failing to touch the palate.
(3.11-12-18)

Six faults in prolonging/sustaining notes are listed: 1) Anagata = to intone the second before the first has been completed 2) Atikrantam = to intone the third by skipping the second note 3) Vichinna = with uneven breaks between notes 4) Vishamahata = to reach the second note by irregularly stressing the first 5) Tanvatam = to pause on a note for more than three matra-s 6) Asthitantam = with indefinite terminals (1-6-19)

We are also told that to deviate from the location of a note is known in Samaga-s as Visvara and in case of others as Virakta.

06) Voice-qualities, instrumental tone, voice culture: From the four fundamental Vani-s (voices), Vaikhari alone consists of Varna and hence it is manifest. The three places of articulation for it are: 1) from Ur (chest) is the Mandra (low), 2) from Kantha (throat) is the Madhya (middle), 3) from Shira (head) is the Tara (high).

The morning, noon and evening Savana-s (recitations) are to be done respectively in Mandra, Madhya and Tara Sthana (octaves)-s (7-6).

The heart is called Swaraja because from it are produced the seven notes. The Kantha and Shira also produce seven notes but the note-production in the heart is Avyakta and hence it is called Pravachana -Vidhi.

Places of origin of notes are as follows:

Kantha (throat)	Shadja
Shir (head)	Rishabha
Nasika (nose)	Gandhara
Ur (chest)	Madhyama
Ur-shir - Kantha (chest, head, throat)	Panchama
Lalāt (forehead)	Dhaiwata
All joints	Nishada (25-5-6)

Shadja is called by that name because it is produced from nose, throat, chest, palate, tongue, and teeth (25-5-7)

The passage of production of notes is identified. Except Dhaivata and Nishad all other notes are produced from five locations.

The air originates in the navel and touches Kantha and Shir (Rishabha). The air originates in the navel and touches Kantha, Shir and Nasika (Gandhar). The air originates in the navel and touches on the Ur and Hridaya (Madhyama). The air originates in the navel and touches on Ur, Hridaya, Kantha and Shir (Panchama).

Swara and Devata (deity) correspondences are noted:

Shadja sung by Agni (fire)	Brahma
Rishabha sung by Brahma	Agni
Gandhar sung by Chandrama	Go
Madhyama sung by Vishnu	
Panchama sung by Narada	Soma
Dhaivata sung by Tumbaru	Chandrama
Nishad	Surya

Nishad also has a special etymology attached to it. 'In it all other notes merge (Nishidanti), hence it is called Nishad' (27-5-17-19). Specific locations from which the Sama-Swara-s originate are separately mentioned:

Krishta (Tara)	Moordha
Prathama	Lalāt
Dvitiya	Bhhoyormadhye (between the brows)
Tritiya	Karna
Chaturtha	Kantha
Mandra	Ur
Atisvarya	Hridaya (37-7-1,2)

Yet another instance of a good analogy used to pass on instruction appears in case of vowel-consonant relationship: 'A vowel conquers a consonant as a strong king does a weak one'. (Second Ashtaka 59-5-4)

07) Instructions for study: Expectably, instructions are detailed as the orientation of the work is of a manual, - a 'how to study' kind of book. Some are briefly noted here to give an idea of the approach and the contemporary relevance of insights obtained from this ancient source:
The disciple should sing as the guru does, by keeping hands on the knees, etc. The Sama-recitation proper should be preceded by Pranav, Vyahruti i.e. Bhurbhusvah and Savitri. By raising the palm, the Swaramandala (tonal framework) should be established and Swara should be intoned without joining the fingers. Measures (matravibhaga) should be properly indicated on the left side, with the middle fingers (Savya). Parva (the finger-joint) should have the Sandhyantara, the lesser intervals are known as Antar. In Sama-recitation, the distance between the thumb and the forefinger is of the size of one grain of Yava and in Rigveda - recitation it is equal to the size of one grain of sesame. However, these fingers are to be joined before and after intoning a note. (31.6.31). The singer should not move his body while producing a note. The portion below the waist should be relaxed and hand should be moved according to the sequence (of the gestural notation). In a series of striking analogies,

we are told that 'fingers move in the stable body as lightening in the sky, bead in a thread, and scissors in hair' (31.6.11). One should utter a note or a Varna with body stilled as by a tortoise and with fearless and calm mind. The body should be tremorless, still and quiet as a hawk (33.6.12-15). While studying we should use fast tempo, while performing it should be medium and while teaching it should be slow (36.7.36). A Pathak (i.e. reciter) should keep fire in the belly burning (i.e. he should not overeat). Having digested the food, he should get up in the early morning and commence singing. As the nights are long from the Sharad (winter) to the Vasant (spring) seasons, he should get up after 25 Ghatika-s (67.2.2.2). He should brush teeth with a Dantadhavan made from Amra, Palash, Bilwa, Apamarga, Shirish, Khair, Kadamb, Karvir and Karanj. Thorny and milky trees bring success, Karvir brings sweetness of tone, subtlety and balance of Varna-s (68.4.2.2). Triphala and salt should be taken after meals or in the evening as it keeps the fire in the belly burning and makes intellect powerful. After having bath etc., one should take honey and Ghee and then begin Samarecitation. (68.7.2.2.) One should at least sing seven Mantra-s in the Mandra octave and then sing according to one's wishes. As far as volume is concerned we are told that, 'one should sing with force, which would not agitate the Prana, as otherwise he would go out of tune, and sweetness of the Varna would be lost.' (69.9.2.2) Those who recite nasally and suffer from a tongue-tie are not fit for recitation. (70.12.2.2) How a Sādhak should be? 'One who is concentrated, without pride, one who avoids very slow music-making' (70.13.2.2.). We are also told that those who are proud, lazy, fickle, disease-ridden, and unable to comprehend what is taught (Stabdha) are unfit to learn.

08) Instruments mentioned and special techniques for playing: Daravi and Gatra are the two kinds of Vina-s noted. The former is the lute as normally understood. The latter is, in reality, the mode of showing proper employment of vowels and consonants to help Brahmins in reciting Sama-s.

09) Mentioned Tala-s: No Tala-s are mentioned though matra i.e. the basic time-measure, is defined.

10) Mentioned Raga-Swara-Grama-Sruti-Swara-s

Udatta	Produced from all locations	Includes Nishad, Gandhar
Anudatta	Produced from lower locations	Includes Rishabha, Dhaivata
Swarita	Produced from middle locations	Includes Shadja, Panchama, Madhyama

(2.2)

Swara-s used by different reciters and their names:

Rigveda-reciter	Archika	one note
Yajurveda -reciter	Gathika	two notes
Samaveda - reciter	Samik	three notes

(3.3)

As these notes are uttered in sacrifice, there is a science of how to use them. Those who do not know the science and use the Swara-s are called Visvara (4.3).

Seven notes, three Grama-s, 21 Murchhana-s and 49 Tana-s together are known as Swaramandala (2.4.11). While Shadja Grama is on the earth (Bhooloka), Madhyama-Grama is from the Bhuvarloka and the Gandhara-Grama only in the heaven (2.6.11,2.7.12). Madhyama, Shadja and Gandhara Grama-s have respectively 20, 14 and 15 Tana-s (2.8.12).

The Gods, ancestors and sages have seven Murchana-s associated with each of them-

Gods: Nandi, Vishala, Sumukhi, Chitra, Chitravati, Sukha, Bala,
Ancestors: (sung by the Yaksha-s): Apyayani, Vishvamrita, Chandra, Kema, Kapardini, Maitri, Baharti
Sages: (sung by men) Uttarmandra (from Sa), Abhirudgata (from Re), Ashvakranta (from Ga), Souvira (from Ma), Hrishyaka (from Pa), Uttarayata (from Dha), Rajani (from Ni) (2.9-13).
What note pleases who, is briefly noted. (2.15,16)

> Satisfying to Devata: Shadja
> Satisfying to Sages: Rishabha
> Satisfying to Ancestors: Gandhara
> Satisfying to Gandharva: Madhyama
> Satisfying to Devata, Sages, and Ancestors: Panchama
> Satisfying to men and other animals: Dhaivata
> Satisfying to Yaksha etc.: Nishada

Characteristics of Madhyamagrama are noted: Gandhar is frequent, Nishad occurs in both ascent and descent, Dhaivata is weak (occurs once) and Shadja and Rishabha are normal. Shadja-Grama is similarly described: Nishad is shortly articulated, Gandhar is frequent, Dhaivata is vibrant and other notes as per the wishes of the singer. The important equivalence of Samaswara-s and those played on Venu is noted as shown below: (24.5.3-4)

Samaga :	Venuvadaka :
Prathama	Madhyama
Dvitiya	Gandhara
Tritiya	Rishabha
Chaturtha	Shadja
Panchama	Dhaivata
Shahtha	Nishad
Saptama	Panchama

Note-nature correspondence is shown thus: (24.5.4)

Shadja	Mayur
Rishabha	Cow

Gandhara	Goat / Sheep
Madhyama	Kraunch bird
Panchama	Cuckoo in spring
Dhaivata	Horse
Nishad	Elephant

The note Nishad has three different names and they are explained: Pariswar = because it is not indicated by phalanxes of the fingers; Asandnyaka = because it is considered different from the other six; Avyaya = because it does not change according to gender, Vachana, Vibhakti.

Various agencies 'live on' (Nirvaha) different notes:

Krishta	Gods
Shadja	Men
Rishabha	Animals
Gandhar	Apsara and Gandharva
Madhyama	Snakes and other egg-produced
Mandra	Asur, Pishaccha-s
Atiswara	All changing and unchanging universe

A very important observation is made about the vexing nature of Sruti-s. 'As foot-marks of fish and birds do not remain in water and sky, similarly the Sruti-s are known by their timbre (dhvanivishesha) and not by their size' (33.7.17).

11) Importance of artists, audience: A clear statement about who likes what is given! It is pithily noted that Acharya-s require Sama (balanced) music, Pandit-s require music which consists of Pada and Chhanda, women require music which is sweet and others high-pitched! (3.13.19)

12) Benefits / adverse effects of music: Bad performance visits on the patron as he loses his life, sons and cattle (6-5).

13) Professional castes / performers: Gandharva-s are mentioned and the term is etymologically explained as: Ga = Gayan i.e. singing, Dha = connotes skilled playing of instruments, Va = instruments (23-4-12) and also as those who came from the Gandharva loka (23-4-12).

14) Schools, styles i.e. Gharana-s: Mentions that different schools are formed on the basis of their way of using notes. Thus: Kantha school = recites in Prathama Swara, Avhar school = first and third notes in high pitch, other schools such as followers of Tandi and Bahllava are also mentioned (11-7,13-8).

15) Music and colour, time, etc.

Shadja	Like the lotus petal
Rishabha	Red
Gandhara	Yellow like gold
Madhyama	Like Kunda flower
Panchama	Black

Dhaivata	Yellow without shine
Nishad	Grey (not in the Sloka)

<div align="right">(20.4.1-2)</div>

Shadja-Madhyama-Panchama	Brahmins
Rishabha-Dhaivata	Kshatriya
Gandhar-Nishad	Vaishya (because they increase)
Other customary notes	Shudra

<div align="right">(20.4.3.4)</div>

I would like to take a quick jump now to the modern period while considering the changing nature of musicology in India. The works can be of course discussed as Naradiya shiksha was. But the modern works are so different in their thrust that the 26-heads inquiry may mean going into unnecessary details; - perhaps not required for the present inquiry.

What is the background for selecting the text discussed hereafter?

Over the years I have realized that musicology needs to be treated as an essentially contested concept. In other words, it is necessary to accept that for each culture, in every epoch and perhaps in each generation it may become imperative to define the content of musicology as a discipline a new according to the prevailing valid perceptions of music - the Janus-faced or the Protean reality!

Secondly, it would therefore mean that there are likely disagreements about what constitutes the core of musicology as a music-related activity of intellection.

Finally, the concept will inevitably arouse controversies of such a nature that interpretations and reinterpretations would carry on a continuous, multi-lectic and at no stage would there be a complete breakdown of interrelationship between performing and scholastic traditions.

This is the reason why some have included everything theoretical related to music in musicology. On the other hand, there are others, (with whom I agree to some extent), who believe that musicology enjoys a narrower scope of inquiry. They further hold that it is inevitably combined with a content of grammatical thrust as well as dynamics, which naturally results in a time-lag between performing and scholastic traditions. In addition, it is argued that musicology carves out an operational area distinctly related to it; - separate from both musical history and musical aesthetics. I submit that various regional Indian contributions to the discipline are to be appreciated and assessed on this backdrop.

One way of engaging with the issue is to try to chronologically trace appearance of important musicological texts in each regional language. This is not to be confused with the strictly marked geographical region as such, For example texts in Marathi are to be examined - and not those published or appearing in Maharashtra alone!

For example, the earliest musicological text filling the bill in Marathi would appear to be the translation-cum-commentary on Sangita Makarand ascribed to one Mutoji Khalchi Vajir-ul-mulk who reportedly authored the work sometime between 1550 and 1650 AD. Incidentally, for a language-literary tradition claiming rich ancestry from the tenth century onwards, the appearance of a musicological work would seem to be rather late in the day.

The other strategy is to examine implicit musicological perceptions in different literary sources such as poetical-philosophical works, historical-sociological records etc. For example, in Maharashtra, references in the Gathasaptashati of Hala (700 AD.), or those in Jnaneshwari, Namadevgatha etc. can be gleaned to shed light on musicological insights of the Marathi society of the period.

Yet another approach, in no way intended to supplant the earlier two, is to concentrate on one single work (or a body of them grouped according to reasonably well-defined guidelines) and undertake a thorough content analysis to reveal nuances of the vision responsible for creating them. The advantage of this strategy is to have an intensively cultivated argument which would enable a more focused debate! I propose to follow the third strategy and take for analysis some selected works in different Indian languages.

Now let us turn to some selected works. I would like to begin the discussion with Ragastan pothi - a book in Gujarati.

Ragastan pothi

<div align="center">

पोथी रोनक बेहेरामजी तेमुरजी

चिनाई पारसी गने आती

भरुचवाशी ओ परवर तानी छे

श्री दमण मधे आ

कावशजी फरदुनजी

श्री दमणना गुजराती

छापखानामो परवर तावतार ने

की जे छापी छे.

शके १८३८ ईसवी.

</div>

The book is in two parts. The first part has: Pothinu Prarambha; Oakdegosha Pothinu Utaro; Tamburo nu Naksho; Shar William Jonesna Janavela Asiatic Pustakmono utaro; Vin no naksho; Doctor Gilkrishtnu Hindoshtani raag visheshu mat.

The second part lists 48 Raga-s divided into eight timeslots, each of three hours' duration beginning from 12 a.m. Mostly Raga-s seem to be allotted to time-slots they are conventionally associated with.

Song texts of compositions in the Raga-s are given. Further, the author refers to Ragamala, Kafi, Rekhta, Pharshi Gazalo as song types that can be performed any time, Kaharvo- at any time of the night, Bashant, Hori and Malar according to the seasons. In other words, these are free from the Time-Raga rules.

The author does not claim originality. He clearly states that his work consists of the essence of three other works explaining the phenomenon of Raga-music.

Firstly, he has translated into Gujarati (with the help of an unnamed friend) a Persian work called Okde-gosha, written by one Mr. Bheju Beg Bawra. It is a kind of grammar of Raga-s. He notes that the word Okde-gosha means 'untying the knot'. We are further informed that Bheju Beg Bawra's work itself was based on a Sanskrit work Sangita Darpan, Persian work Sahmshol Ashwat and some other works dealing with the same theme. Secondly, he has summarized Sir William Jones's writing published in the third part of Asiatic Researches brought out from Calcutta. And finally, he had also relied on Dr. Gilchrist's writings on Hindustani Raga-s.

The book ends with an exhaustive Shuddhipatra!

Was the author well versed in the performing tradition? If so how does he include the famous composition in Raga Khat -Vidyadhar- to be in Raga Bibhas?

Why was he interested in translating works from English and Persian into Gujarati?

Is it not significant that a Parsi gentleman should author this early effort in explaining the theoretical basis of Hindustani art music?

Nada-vinod

This work in Hindi by Pannalal Goswami was published in Delhi in Samvat 1852. In an extensive introduction titled Nadvinod-Bhoomika, which begins with a fulsome praise of Maharani Victoria, the author also gives Swavanshavarnanam, (i.e. description of his own family). He tells us that the family hailed from Multan (the real name of which, according to him, was Mula-Sthan i.e. original place) and was brought to Delhi by Humayun when he was returning to Delhi from Iran. The author adds that from the days of Humayun to those of Bahadurshah - the family received unstinted appreciation and patronage because of the rich familial knowledge of yoga and Nadavidya (music). Pannalal's father Ramlalji and three other brothers - Ratnalalji, Hiralalji and Krishnalalji were Vaishnava musicians. Pannalalji learnt from his father as well as from elder brothers and visited many sacred places as also seats of patronage in India. By the time he wrote Nad-vinod he had about 40 years study of music behind him.

Some prominent features of the work can briefly be stated as below:

1. The author is a Sanskritist with a difference. He is well acquainted with the Sanskrit tradition. His chapter division, inclusion of dance and instrumental music in his exposition, tendency to quote Sanskrit authorities bring this out well.

2. At the same time his penchant to give Duha-s, Kavitta, use of Urdu words etc. make us aware that he was a product of a music-culture with a northern orientation i.e. an orientation to which Persian and Urdu sources of literature, language and music-making were an integral part. In this context, the whole section entitled 'Nad-vinod Mudrit Hone ke Samvat Ka Varnan' is an entertaining example. It is instructive to note that similar ceremonial dating or naming of a work etc. is not in case of Wajid Ali's publications. It is common knowledge that use of Duha-s to codify, memorize and impart and imbibe technical information in music was an accepted avenue to musicological expertise among professional musicians. The scattered Duha-literature on musicology and music is in fact, alienated from the post 16th century music and musicians; - a number of whom were non-Hindu-s and illiterate Hindu-s.

3. The author's use of terminology reflects the same synthesis of the Sanskrit and (if one may say so) Prakrit traditions in music. For example, he explains how Shadja, the fundamental note has four names (the other three being Kharaj, Sa and Swara).
Shadja = produced when the breath touches at six places.
Kharaj = Kha = sky, also Khar = navel, hence Kharaj
Swara = one which merges in the middle and end of a Sruti to give delight to the listener.
Sa = the subtle linguistic version of kharaj.
Similarly, he argues that Sthapanayi or Sthayi have give us the term asthayi though it actually refers to a stable musical phenomenon.

4. Pannalal's explanation of Meend, Jamjama, Soot, Jhala and Thok Jhala is clear indication of his close acquaintance with performing tradition in instrumental music and especially the emerging sitar and the been-tradition on which it was based. His allocation of sections to the tuning of been and sitar is also a noteworthy feature.

5. Pannalal tells us that the motivation to write the work was to make propagation of authentic music easier. Hence his simple notation system seems a logical outcome. It is interesting to note that the author also gives some Raginis in a kind of staff-notation so that the 'Angrej' patrons would be able to follow the Raga-s! Obviously, the urge to easy propagation made Pannalal rather ambitious!

6. Pannalal's book needs to be examined as an attempt to match the Lakshya with the Lakshana. In other words, he was trying to seek establish a closer correspondence between prevailing, performing and scholastic traditions in Hindustani music.

His listing of Uparaga-s i.e. Dhunraga-s is impressive. For example, it includes Jhinjhoti, Jangala, Pilu, Barwa, Dhani, Tilang, Asa, Sindh, Sohar, Sohoni, Gara, Bhatiyari, Bihi, Sajgiri, Sarparda, Lavani, Jogiya, Sahana etc. In his section Ragavarnanam he also lists some Raga-s as Deshi Raga-s and refers to them as those with a context to specific regions.

7. Finally, an easy test of his relationship with the performing tradition is provided by the fact that quite a few of his compositions match in matters of raga as well as the text - with what we do today! With a cursory glance I could spot the following:

Khayal Tilwada	Bhairav: Balamava
Khayal Jhumra	Natmalhar: Kahe ho
Khayal	Shudh Malhar: Karim nam tero, Umad Ghan Ghumad
Khayal Tilwada	Deskar: Re Katwa
Hori	Sindura: Na daiya me
	Hindol: Chanak bund par
	Bahar: Saghan Ghani
	Gandhari Todi: Sachi kahat adarang pyare
	Gujri todi: Yeri mai aaj

The next two works appeared in Maharashtra though in different languages. The titles are:

1. Sangita Darpan Masik Pustak: Ichalkarnjikar, Balkrishnabuwa, Bombay, 1883.
2. Hindu Music and the Gayan Samaj: Sahasrabuddhe, Balwant Trimbak, Pune, 1887.

There are reasons to devote attention to these two works. Firstly, both are from the pre-Bhatkhande period. The works could therefore be expected to throw light on the grammatical bias of musicology, which Bhatkhande brought to the fore from 1909 onwards.

Secondly, while the first work is produced by a practicing musician with no claims to scholarship, the second is written by a person well-educated, employed gainfully by the British rulers (in fact in the Department of Education) and whose interest in music was clearly a product of nascent nationalism. It is clear that Sahasrabuddhe was more of a reformist-academician than a music-lover or an aesthete eager to appreciate music as an art.

Thirdly, Ichalkaranjikar's writings were concerned with technical details of music as performance and teaching. On the other hand, Sahasrabuddhe was committed to propagation of music and to record high-points of the history of Indian music heralded as a glorious component of a larger cultural tradition, which he identified as Hindu.

Fourthly, Sangita Darpan Masik Pustak is in Marathi, and thus it had the Marathi-using region as its target audience. Even this could be viewed to be a nationalistic act! As is known, Bhatkhande wrote barely forty years later in Marathi with a marked sense of pride, again a fact related to the new feeling of Indian identity. Sahasrabuddhe, on the other hand, wrote in English, though he was responsible for other publications in Marathi. His efforts were directed at creating an impact on foreign rulers and those social classes that were a product of the 'new

education'. These later spread all over the country and could use only English as link-language.

Finally, both the authors were Brahmins. They represent a class of people who, because of their family-traditions, must have gone through some struggle to maintain high social profile in spite of their love for music of a different kind, namely of a professional variety as distinct from religious or devotional.

Sangita Darpan Masik Pustak

As a case-study, the following features of Ichalkarnjikar's, slim but precise volume are worth-noting:

a) Though the author was a prominent vocalist, the book devotes a large portion to Sitar, Been, and their music. It is interesting to note that though Maharashtra did not reach the top in instrumental music in general and Sitar etc. in particular, there are many clear indications that Sitar enjoyed a good following. For example, apart from the very early published material on the instrument, it is instructive to note the traditional vogue of giving every vocalist some initial training in a string-instrument.

b) It is obvious that the author relied chiefly on the performing tradition, as is apparent from the sparse use of quotations from and very selective references to Sanskrit authorities. (For instance, Ragarnava, Yadnyavalkysmriti are referred to). Further, textual authorities are seldom invoked - a fact certainly indicative of the author's loyalties!

c) A pronounced dependence on the performing tradition is seen from the terms used and from the statements made about fundamental concepts such as Raga, Tala and Bandish i.e. composition and related matters. For example, the terms Kharaj, Swarita and Dupat are respectively used for Mandra, Madhya and the Tara octaves. His non-use of the term Shuddha is obviously notable. He prefers to describe lower varieties of any note as 'Komal and the higher as 'Tivra'.

The author unambiguously indicates that there is no absolute pitch in Indian music though intervals from the chosen fundamental are predetermined.

Ichalkaranjikarbuwa interestingly observes that raga-s are distinguished not only because of inclusion or exclusion of certain notes from the scale but also due to shortening of longer notes (but not vice versa), and employment of certain gamaka (he lists seven).

Many of his definitions are not likely to be acceptable.

For example, Murchana is Swar halvine (स्वर हलविणे), Shadava = taking four out of seven notes in the Aroha/avaroha, Grama = Shadja, Madhyama and Panchama Swara. Anaghata (instead of Anagata, though he uses the paired term Ateeta correctly). However, such usage merely indicates that he was falling back on reported

knowledge in the sense that he does not appear to have consulted original, standard and musicological texts.

He states that the '22 sruti' affair is difficult to experience though the Shastric position is 'comprehensible'. The author also notes that though every extension of a nucleus of notes is to be regarded a 'Tan', the prevailing practice confined the term to Alap-s in fast tempo.

d) Two of his elaborate statements concern matters of musical perception, important for practitioners of music as well. The sureness he displays in dealing with the items suggests that the concerned practices were being followed widely.

Firstly, he describes how perception of musical intervals can be developed and taught by a methodical listening to Tanpura. Secondly, he lays down a method of playing Tanpura according to the Tala employed by an artist while making music.

e) Not surprisingly, the author quotes from the known Ayurveda tradition to discuss vocal disorders. This again is an indication that his orientation was towards performance and the theoretical exposition he was interested in was not 'bookish' - to use a term prevalent in the nineteenth century. It is to be noted that the famous Prakirnaka Adhyaya in Ratnakara describes voice in terms of Ayurveda, though Ichalkaranjikarbuwa does not refer to it. In other words he was relying back on a performing tradition, which was perhaps not aware of its past musicological moorings.

f) The author's accent on notation should come as a significant surprise. He not only tries to notate the textual, rhythmic and the melodic frameworks but also goes to great lengths in devising some rudimentary signage to indicate actual voice-production, or use of the plectrum-strokes etc. Given Ichalkaranjikar's lack of academic qualifications, this is certainly most unexpected! However, contrary to the general notion, he and many other performers from the period were quite open-minded about music-related matters - provided they were convinced that the new ways or approaches were not merely intellectually conceived!

Ichalkaranjikar is on record to have appreciated many and modern efforts in music initiated in Bengal by Sourendranath Tagore.

g) As is to be expected from a widely travelled musician with adequate professional awareness, Ichalkaranjikarbuwa never fails to note those technical details which, being comparatively recent, may not have immediately attracted attention of theoreticians of music.

For example, he firmly explains to us the exact difference between Kalingda and Benarasi Kalingda or how the singing in Madhyama (by regarding it to be the fundamental) changes the whole tenor of music.

There are other matters of musico-cultural interest, which he touches upon, though a bit harshly. For example, he refers to the fact that most of those women who learnt music were 'professional' women lacking in imagination as well as aptitude and hence could hardly be expected to be creative. He also comes down heavily on those engaged in 'teaching' of music 'deceitfully' (the Marathi word he uses is, 'kapatane' - कपटाने) i.e. by reducing it to a mode of teaching which relies merely on teaching compositions i.e. Cheej-s. Of similar importance is his treatment of themes such as construction and playing technique of and the practice lessons for sitar. Yet another notable feature is the description of some Raga-s as grammatical frameworks.

It is however now opportune to turn to the other work in this examination of significant musicological sampler.

Hindu Music And The Gayan Samaj

A) The table of contents of the work reveals an author who was well versed in the scholastic tradition of music. He touches upon Margi and Deshi systems, Shruti-, Swara, Gama, Varna, Raga, instrumental music, Tala, dancing, merits and demerits of musicians and poetry. It is noteworthy that he also tries to give a context of both Hindustani and Carnatic systems of music to his discussion. The quoted authorities, references to works in Sanskrit, and in fact, the general tone of the entire work leaves us in no doubt that the chief goal of the author was to prove the existence, establish the authority of, and earn respect for the 'science' of 'native' music described by the author as Hindu.

B) The second part of the book is a documentation of the multifaceted work carried on by the Gayan Samaj founded with a missionary zeal and run with an equally energetic manner by the author. The third part has 8 appendices with information on:
I. Sanskrit treatises on Hindu music
II. Six principal Raga-s.
III. Principal raga-s and their wives.
IV. Raga-s, Ragini-s known in Northern India.
V. Raga-s and Ragini-s in Southern India.
VI. Tala-s
VII. Musical instruments in India.
VIII. Musicians of note in Northern and Southern India.

C) It is apparent that the author tries to construct a wide framework in order to incorporate under a common theoretical umbrella two systems of art-music known today as Hindustani and Carnatic. For example, using the term Alapana, obviously referring to raga-elaboration and/or improvisation, he brings together 12 Hindustani and 8 Carnatic forms of music as sub-classes. The attempt is to place the two well known art music-s in India as parts of a larger design, a dream for every ambitious Panini of music in India!

D) The book goes a long way in bringing out the comprehensive nature of the author's efforts to introduce 'written tradition' in Indian music. Notation, writing of reports, books, articles, preparation of syllabuses, formulating questionnaires and collecting information to be later reduced to tables, forms, etc.- these and such other features are self-explanatory. It is not necessary to dwell on the inherent relationship between the scholastic core of musicology and the importance of these and similar written modes of organizing, preserving and codifying the relevant material.

E) There is evidence to suggest that one of the aims, which the author held close to his heart, was to prove existence of the phenomenon of Harmony as a principle of tonal organization in Indian music. Obviously, this undertaking had more political overtones than musicological! As one moves ahead in the twentieth century the political urge would be replaced by a sociological concern to use musicological positions to enhance social prestige of music. Musicology seems to have an in-built extra-musical ambition in India - quite for some time!

The Shastra in the folk

This brief case study is intended to draw attention to the fact that even if musicology is (rather unjustifiably) narrowed to raga-music, it can hardly restrict itself to elite music making as it does today! Some terms used by Langa musicians of Rajasthan are noted below to indicate existence of precise music-related rules, verbalization of concepts and application of technical terminology in musical behaviour of the so-called 'folk' variety of music. In my opinion, these musicians are categorized as 'folk' by us and appreciated or criticized without much knowledge of the musical map which they follow.

Raga is called Chala. Chala is classified in three sub classes: Toisa (6 Matra), Teentar (7 Matra) Kalwada (8 Matra, of 8 sub-types). Toisa is played on the Dhol and has Patakshara-s. This is not played on Dholak-which does not have Patakshara-s.

Some Raga-names are : Sorath Ka Sur, Subh Ka Sur, and Kohari Ka Sur'. Every Raga-name has a story associated with it as well as a Duha connected with it.

The duha normally contains a story - which is an episode material. Sometimes, the Duha is in praise of a Raga. A Raga, without a Duha displays a confusing structure.

Interesting terms are used to differentiate musical notes. Thus Sa, the fundamental is called Dadar (which in many musical contexts unfortunately means a frog!), Panchama is known as Agor (the word means 'catchment area of collected water'), Madhyama is called Dyodha (means one and half times). The term Adhak indicates a strategy of proceeding by taking the note Re as the Sa - an obvious instance of the ancient Murchūrā mode.

Notes other than the above are identified thus: first, second, third and fourth notes from the Dadar respectively correspond to re, ga, ma and pa. (Dadar se pehala etc). This is followed by another enumeration, by using the same procedure, but the counting begins from the Agor: thus the first and second from the Agor are, respectively, dha, and ni (agor se pehala etc). The Komal status of a note is described as Kachha and the Shuddha as Pakka. The Mandra octave is called Adi or Neecha and the Tara is called Khadi or Uncha.

Important instruments in the repertoire of the Langa-s are: Ravanhattha, Jogia Sarangi and Surinda. Bows of these instruments have Ghungaroo-s attached to them. The bowing corresponds to the rhythmic patterns of the song - only the Ravanhattha appears to be different, probably because it follows patterns of the verse-contour. Jogia sarangi has a more rhythmic bowing.

The Nagara is developed on the lines of Tala-music in the elite traditions. Thus it has Tala-names, names for the sections of the Tala and definite instructions about playing of certain sound-syllables etc. On the other hand Khartal and Dholak do not evince firm lines of development elaboration of rhythmic ideas.

Some Complaints / Conclusions

1) Despite earlier inclusive stance, Indian musicology seems to have discontinued taking interest in non-elite musical categories.

2) Modern musicology ignored (failed) to appreciate to that the prime characteristic of traditional Indian musicology has been codification. Once this thrust is noticed, the relatively low ranking of verbalization and writing down of the material may cease to appear un-pardonable sins!

3) Indian musicology, especially its modern, post-British avatar, represents a cultural decision to give weight-age to grammatical orientation. Consequently, specific features such as hierarchy of multiple criteria, conceptual clarity, terminological precision found a place in the model of systematization that emerged. However, the apparent underlying decision to follow physics and biology as more scientific models etc. was uncalled for.

4) Links with poetics were almost completely severed for no apparent reason and its important role in the inherited musicology was ignored.

5) The matrix of much traditional wisdom in the country has been the oral tradition (-of course in its Indian avatar!). This was not properly appreciated. The flexibility of the oral tradition was misinterpreted as a lack of scientific attitude while resorting to the newly acquired Written tradition.

6) Time-lags between scholastic and performing traditions are due to their respective inherent make-ups and natural functions. The former tradition provides stability

while the latter is all dynamism. Artists and scholars have the joint responsibility to balance these functions. Instead, modern musicologists tended to over-define /over-codify the material circulating in the Indian oral tradition with adverse, though avoidable consequences.

7) Modern musicology in India stopped raising new questions - obviously it failed to take notice of the changing music around.

8) It is necessary to state that many features of modern musicology owed their origin to the nascent nationalism. That may however explain its shortcomings but cannot justify them!

9) It could be said that Indian musicology has so far illustrated a career which has an hourglass pattern. Thus, in the beginning it allowed itself a wide scope till Pt. Bhatkhande and his followers narrowed it down to an entirely grammatical interpretation of music. However, after this point of narrowing was reached, there are signs that in the post-Bhatkhande period there is again a perceptible widening of the sphere of its activities. Once again it may have the honour of being a qualitatively alert discipline ranging across the continuously expanding theoretical appreciation of music as a phenomenon. being an arch-rebel among arts, it is perhaps natural for musicians to swim against the current and talk with easy enthusiasm and new concern about history!

        After reflecting on the tenets of musicology followed in Indian Texts on music, the author engages himself, in the Chapters that follow, on the History of Hindustani Music, closely related to Contemporary Performance Practices.

Part Two

Towards History of Hindustani Music

Chapter Four
Nature of Musical Phenomena

Introduction

In my discussion of Indian Musicology, I ventured to defend my use of the preposition 'towards' in relation to Indian musicology. I submitted that, despite its durable and meritorious antecedents, Indian Musicology needs a change in direction, position and content if it is to enjoy a continued relevance. I feel more confident in making a similar suggestion about the historical treatment of Hindustani music.

Firstly, some rethinking is warranted in view of the general Indian (and perhaps the Asian) lack of historical sense, already noted by professional historians. Secondly, history and related concepts, as they have been so far set forth today, need to be recognized as 'essentially contested'. Historical perspective as such has proved to be a fertile ground for raising more and more contentious thought-structures. It appears to resemble the doll within a doll -toy- from the erstwhile USSR! This is why a chain of related and yet self-sufficient thought-structures associated with the historical view can be put forward thus: History → Cultural History → Art History → History of Performing Arts → Music-history → Hindustani Music-History. All historical statements in the chain are links within an inherently connected thought process - but each enjoys a limited autonomy. In reality, Hindustani music deserves discussion in the context of each of these thought-structures; - and such a treatment of the subject would be a gain.

A passing thought may be mentioned. Does it sound anachronistic to talk about history at the present juncture, in case of the talk about the end of history? I submit that music, the year was 1898. Fierce debates were taking place between Cleveland and Harrison during the American Presidential Election. It was symptomatic that, while the Americans were facing some of the toughest problems, an illustrious Committee of Ten was appointed to identify various issues to be looked into. One of its sub-committee was on History. The sub-committee, with Woodrow Wilson as one of its members, recommended that all high-school students, whether going for college education or not, must learn history for four years because, as the committee noted, the subject 'best promoted the invaluable mental power which we call judgement'. (As there have been more committees since - obviously the advice had not been taken seriously!) But, the point to be emphasized is that appointing more and more deliberative bodies to consider the issue of history clearly indicates human inclination to face the basic problem historians seek to tackle - how to use the past - fruitfully. This point is of relevance and interest to musicians and music-thinkers though it might prove more useful to take it up later in the discussion.

When faced with musical problems, in the last few years I have repeatedly turned to history and in particular to history of music. The guiding principle has been: in order to understand the nature of any problem, turn to its history. However, my efforts of historical comprehension, though not altogether fruitless, failed to give total satisfaction, chiefly because the way in which music-histories have been written in India.

It must be admitted that to an extent, shortcomings of musical histories are traceable to the essential nature of performing arts in general. On the other hand, some other deficiencies appear to be specifically related to the Indian attitude to music, as also to cultural history. In other words, the need of the hour is to attend to concepts that actively shape cultural history, performing arts and music as linked phenomena.

Cultural Histories and Music

The most important feature normally ignored by cultural histories in India, while working on performing arts and allied fields, is the effective role of a categorial pentad coexisting in India for centuries. As I have frequently argued, in Indian culture, categories identified as primitive, folk, religious, art and popular actually serve as fundamental moulds of both expression and experience. Reception of musical stimuli, organization of musical material, projection of the performing musical intent, preservation and propagation of musical continuities - all such phases are remarkably influenced by circulation of music-s of the five categories through length and breadth of the country. Historians who concentrate on the elitist i.e. art - expression, without taking cognizance of the other four, do so at their peril because, no single category can make sense if it is viewed in isolation. Irrespective of the category of one's own immediate interest, it is imperative to take cognizance of the large hinterlands created by other categories to get a sense of the historical dynamics music has enjoyed in India.

Problems traceable to the Nature of Musical Phenomena

Music is temporal, not because it takes place in time but because it manipulates time. It creates its own time to generate non-rhythmic patterns in melodic and verbal dimensions, as also through manifestations of the phenomenon of Rhythm understood as an aesthetic principle employed in every creative exploration of reality. Music gives more importance to duration than time-points. Broadly, it can be said that, while time-points function as dividing terminations, duration refers to relationships subsisting between time-points imaginatively brought into circulation. **Time → musical time → rhythm → tala** is a conceptual chain operating at various levels in music and the results are expectably very diverse. In short, musical experience is inherently bound to temporality and its exploration.

Yet another inherent feature of music, relevant to the present discussion is, the remarkable continuity of performing traditions as contrasted with the discontinuities of scholastic traditions related to them. I am of course aware of the

contrary positions taken by some historians. They have argued - especially with reference to Contemporary History - that the Principle of Essential Continuity in historical processes is being overstressed. In this context, an aphorism by Russell is often quoted with approval. 'The universe is all spots and jumps!' The fortuitous and the unforeseen; the new, the dynamic, and the revolutionary etc. in musical behaviour obviously add to the difficulties of protagonists of the continuity view. Further, as a result, the historians' hidden agenda, that of establishing a comprehensible causality is often the first casualty. As Herbert Butterfield once pointed out, the ordinary arguments of causality are, 'by no means sufficient in themselves to explain the next stage of the story, the next turn of events'. It is clear that the Principle of Continuity is cherished because one of its side-benefits is that it makes statement of causality much easier. However, I submit that historians who hold to this view are not dealing with the performing phenomenon which provides examples of categorial transfers, or of an intermittent dormancy, and finally of a kind of atavism.

In the first case, that of categorial transfer, a musical feature may cease to appear in its original category (from the five mentioned earlier i.e. art, primitive, folk, religious and popular) but its operations are detected in another category. The second possibility, that of intermittent dormancy is self evident. It indicates that there has been a notable time-gap in an otherwise continued appearance of a particular feature of musical expression. The third possibility points to resurfacing of the same or similar musical feature after a gap of one generation. In contrast to this variably continuous performing tradition, the scholastic tradition, though intrinsically related to performing continuity, gives a feeling of a discontinuous, 'progressive' march inclined towards consolidation followed by stabilization. In addition, scholastic tradition usually lags behind the performing tradition to which it is related. In some rare cases, a scholastic genius may anticipate a performing reality, but by and large, an exact co-termination or correspondence of performing and scholastic traditions merely appears to be a theoretical possibility, in fact a cultural dream!

The foregoing brief discussion of musical time and the two music - related traditions has obvious connection with two important features associated with the historical view of reality. They are chronology and periodization.

Some Remarks on Chronology, Periodization and Musical Ideas

History customarily sets store by arranging events in the order of time of their occurrence. Events, we are told, are results of some action. Further, they are marked as clearly manifest changes, even though changes may lack durability. Enduring changes become objects. In turn they become subjects of discussion, inquiry, propagation etc. and to that extent they would be identified as phenomena having recognizable potential to create a tradition.

Now the nagging question is: Which events can be identified as musical? The usually quoted examples are, birth (of a would be)/ death of (an accepted, recognized) musician, discovery of an instrument/ genre, commencement of Talim (i.e. training), taking place of the first or an important concert, writing/ publication of a book, recording/ broadcasting/ telecasting of a composition etc. However, the question needs to be raised is: Are these, in reality, instances of music related acts or those of genuine Musical events? Admittedly, they are results of some action. They may also suggest some perceivable change. And yet, by themselves, they cannot claim to have a content appropriate for consideration/ inclusion in musical history. These and similar events can, at the most, be put into some orderly exposition, as supportive material of the hard core of musical history.

There is a strong reason for describing these events as music-related. In my opinion, they are related to peripherals, and not to the core of musical experience, which makes music qualitative. The core of a musical experience is made real because in it one detects the presence of a musical idea, which, in itself, may or may not be valuable. Events must consist of musical ideas if they are to be constituents of music-history. In my opinion, in the final analysis, history of musical events would actually mean a history of musical ideas: Music-related events could be taken into account, if and when, they lead the way to identification, explanation or 'framing' or contextualizing of a musical idea. For a start, I may put down the following definition of a musical idea:

'Musical idea is an intellectual and emotional formulation of musical and non-musical cultural components, by individuals or related groups. The idea is assumed to have a reasonable performing potentiality, at some time or the other. Multiple acts of such formulations determine the nature, quality and course of music in the concerned culture.'

I am aware that the attempt to give a definition has turned in to a description! However, the intention is to clarify the position.

Can Musical Ideas Be Chronologically Placed?

A question now raises its head.: Can such ideas be chronologically placed? Can they be stated to have occurred at a certain time, or on a certain date, etc.?

It must be admitted that in performing contexts Time-computation would need to follow larger rhythms because musical ideas inevitably evolve into identifiable expression/ projection over long periods. Therefore, terms such as eons, ages, era, epoch, centuries etc. would naturally come to mind. However, to me, all these and similar terms actually are negations of chronology. Historians may be reminded of geo-history in this context. Is it then truer to say, with Levi Strauss, that all historical knowledge emerges as discontinuous and classificatory' because attempts at chronology, based on 'before-after' criterion, provide dates which, in reality, do not form a series: they are of different species'! From contemporary to modern, to medieval, to ancient, to pre-historic etc. are jumps from one class of dates

to the other, each being a differently coded system. Thus, in effect, we are not merely referring to larger/ longer rhythms of time but to qualitatively different temporal-planes.

The Essential Continuity in Music

I have already made a reference to the Principle of Performing Continuity. It is perhaps helpful to devote some time to it, as we have already discussed the concept of musical idea. Very often, musical ideas appear to have recognizable and earlier avatar-s - thereby suggesting a Continuity. I venture to surmise that this is one of the reasons why musicians appear to be reluctant researchers! A rigorous looking into the past is most likely to deny the pleasure of claiming originality! Probably the expected research finding would state that 'Somebody has done it before (and perhaps better!)' - an obviously and extremely disconcerting revelation! Once again, validity of succession of discrete time-divisions becomes suspect. Of course, I am not suggesting that it is impossible to plot and place musical ideas and events on temporal dimension, or that such a plotting is not helpful to obtain some kind of cultural readings. The argument put forward is about the validity of the basic procedure advocated for a general adoption. Today, datable events are regarded important, while the process should be the reverse! Further, I would like to suggest that, in view of the continuousness of performing traditions and the consequent germaneness of larger rhythms, it would be difficult to hold that everything new cancels out the earlier. Demarcation, and therefore chronological placement, will inherently and inevitably become difficult. A new set of criteria would be needed, as also its flexible application.

The argument in favour of a modified principle of chronology, in fact, points to primacy of valuational decisions over the near-automatic application or use of temporal marking or fixing of musical events. This argument of bringing in the valuational aspect obviously runs counter to the proclaimed objectivity of historians. What is music/ musical can hardly be decided through recourse to the much proclaimed 'objectivity' - as the attitude is usually described. Fortunately, the opposite of objective is not (irrespective of the usual practice) 'subjective' - but interpretative. What is music/ musical is determined through interpretative acts, which are naturally and genuinely variable. All attempts to turn them into constant, universal, and objective acts have failed - as is proved by aestheticians. discussions in every culture.

Some New Orientations

1) Perhaps, at this stage it is advisable to make a brief reference to some new orientations in writing history. In fact, alert awareness of new approaches in history writing should be listed as the first of the new orientations music historians need to care for. Historians are coming up with new procedures and formats, understandably with more or less success. Consequently, the historical material has been kept in a churning state - which is in my view, itself a useful act. The better the circulation of historical material, the greater the chances of relevant and fresh applications.

2) Due to various factors, historians have made a useful distinction between Contemporary and Modern History.

Admittedly, historians are arguing about the validity of the approach described as Contemporary History because, in this approach, by definition, there cannot be much notable distance between observer and observed. This nearness, it is urged, makes objectivity impossible. How can you see in perspective something, which is recent? - it is asked. However, there are many who have maintained that, the so called objectivity is not really a necessary pre-condition for historical treatment, and further, objectivity is, any way, nothing more than a cherished fiction. Contemporary world, it is vehemently argued, needs a contemporary approach.

A crucial question is: What could be the time-span for identifying something as contemporary. The approach, which in itself goes back to 1950-s, advocates concentration on a period of 70 to 100+ years. It seems to me that the main stimulus to the advocacy of the contemporary approach is the quality of immediacy of impact expected of a recent happening. The idea is to catch and know it while it is hot! In essentials, the approach allows a role to memory of the informants and chiefly to documents, which have not gathered researcher's dust. However, it is necessary to point out that, in addition to the premium placed on the immediacy of impact, the approach introduces a very subtle investigative tone-change: the approach in fact includes a movement away from the prestigious principle of causality. As we know, as a tribe, historians usually are keen on tracing events back to causes, which have preceded them, and are also lodged in the past. In other words, Contemporary history, though it does not abandon causality, certainly tries to reduce the much-vaunted importance of the documentary past by replacing it with the immediate past.

In this approach, memory, as a repository of data, assumes significance because, by definition, the observer's proximity to the observed time-span, his nearness to the events is legitimized by contemporary history. This feature is intrinsically linked to another exciting approach identified as Oral History. Contemporary History, as an approach, has an undisputed potential in the fast changing music world.

3) Oral History - as an approach is, in a way, not new to musicians because of the well-developed Oral tradition. Jan Vansina, the archpriest of Oral tradition in the Western scholarly community, defined oral tradition as, 'oral testimony transmitted verbally from one generation to the next one or more'. However, the concept of Oral Tradition needs to be differently understood in Indian contexts. Consequently, Oral History too changes its orientation. Therefore, I do not see reasons to restrict it to Contemporary History, as some have argued in the West.

4) Urban History can, in relation to music, be profitably turned into a study of capital cities and patronage-seats. Despite the orientation the approach has acquired in America from the 1960-s, music-history in India can benefit from the approach if the basic distinction between habitations, hamlets, villages on one hand and townships, cities and metropolitan cities on the other, is carefully followed. On account of varied

socio-cultural factors, it is the second group, which acts as a generator of ideas. The erstwhile Indian Princely States, well established religious seats etc. need to be studied as generators/ propagators of and platforms for new musical ideas. A variation of this approach is also known as Local History.

5) What Subaltern studies have achieved for general historical studies, categorial studies may accomplish for music-history. Antonio Gramsci's work has propelled an approach called 'History from Below', obviously to reject and correct the existing bias in historical writing which tends to be mostly about ruling classes instead of the people. In India, writing of music-history - and in fact most of the writing on music as such - has generally concentrated on art-music. Primitive, folk, religious and popular categories of music have hardly been taken into consideration. The approach under consideration may provide the corrective.

6) Writers on Indian music must remember the sub-continental expanse of India. To write about any feature of Hindustani music, for example, all areas covered by this system of music should provide the perspective. Only then, the exposition can hope to be complete. A proper appreciation of regional variations will develop a healthy respect in our mind about the non-prescriptive character of music as a way of emoting, thinking, expressing and communicating. An approach identified today, as Area Study may prove useful in this respect. Area Study is an educational term for inter- disciplinary and scholarly studies focusing on the peoples of a definable geographical area. Even before the Zonal Cultural Centres came on the scene, I began working on the principle that every particular region in India needs to be studied in the setting of cultural zones defined by contiguous geographical borders. The approach can perhaps be suitably described as Cultural-zone History. This approach is likely to cure many of the maladies of insular cultural thinking.

7) The global - village phenomenon, that has become a household concept after we have become aware of the recent media-explosion, requires to be taken more seriously in music. Music-changes, could therefore be a special-interest area for the students of Contemporary history. Art music-s of both the Hindustani and Carnatic varieties have taken places of pride in the world of music. It is therefore necessary that music-history takes into consideration the world musical scene, - - - of which Indian music is now a part, - in fact as a force in a larger musical movement. As has been often pointed out, the world is now so knit together that 'contracting out' is hardly possible. There is a new commonality and the sooner we understand the larger cultural map, the better for all the parties concerned. Though difficult to imagine its final shape, we are perhaps not far from Universal History - an approach tried before by many but without in reality grasping the enormity or the magnitude of the task.

8) History of music should pay attention firstly, to other performing arts, secondly to the arts as such and finally to culture. In fact, one should imagine these three as constituting related and relevant concentric circles - with the concerned cultural group at the centre. In this context, approaches described as Cultural History.

History of Material Culture and Intellectual History may prove illuminating. The three are essentially acts intended to selectively widen the perspectives adopted to investigate. Johan Huizinga, the chief exponent of Cultural History described it as a 'study of themes, symbols, concepts, ideals, styles and sentiments'.

Obviously, this sounds ambitious and perhaps elitist. The approach known as History of Material Culture should work as an antidote because it proposes to study all items/ objects from pin to piano to analyze their uses as well as contexts.

Intellectual History or History of Ideas are two approaches which are interdisciplinary and, in addition, they virtually lodge a protest against the convenient fragmentation of human life into various knowledge-areas such as, philosophy, arts, culture etc. It is argued that ideas etc. are human formulations having roles and influences which always transcend study-facilitating activities, procedures etc. Hence, the approach advises that corrective needs to be applied through recourse to carefully identified concepts.

One of the fascinating insights that has emerged to move away from over-division of fields of experience is known as the 'Spirit of the Age'. The underlying principle is to identify one single expansive concept as the motivating, infusing spirit which guides, influences and marks varied manifestations during a period. For manageable and smaller periods, the approach appears to have been valid to explain powerful trends.

9) An approach which can fruitfully be pursued in India on account of the unique Indian multiplicity of music-s, is the approach known as Comparative History. A Comparative Historian chooses specific problems and compares societies, groups etc. across time and space. While doing so, he emphasizes differences, as well as, parallels. This generally proves enlightening to a wide variety of people.

10) Ethno-history was an approach once formalized for studying pre-literate societies. However, its legitimacy as well as utility was soon questioned and Oral History and other approaches were put forward to provide correctives.

11) Yet another interesting approach is known as Everyday Studies with the obvious concentration on the common life-acts of the common people. Less dramatically, the approach is also known as Social History. This point of view, with its protest against elitist notion of history, is obviously closer to the category of Popular Music.

12) Historicism was once put forward as an approach with the intention of treating each age as unique. Each age was thus to be interpreted in terms of its own ideas, principles, criteria, etc.

13) Psychohistory is an approach that advocated consideration of the subconscious and the private elements of human experience. Attempts have been made to apply the approach to groups as contrasted with single individuals. The approach has obvious affinities to biographical studies; - so favoured by writers on music in India!

14) With a view to lay stress on a serious use of statistical evidence, an approach has been identified as Quantitative History. A new name for a similar angle is Serial History. Following the approach, large amounts of statistical data, ranging over long periods, can be collected and interpreted as pendulum-swings of continuities and discontinuities.

It is not claimed that all wide avenues opened up by these approaches are being vigorously explored. It is hoped that however sporadic these he may be; it is possible to detect such attempts.

History is generally understood to be a systematic record of past events. However, it is rightly pointed out that all records of the past cannot pass muster as history even if they are, in addition to relating to the past also systematic. For example, description, analysis, narrative annals, chronicles and biographies are only apparently history-s. At the most, they can claim to be partially historical. History is distinct from these records despite some obvious overlaps. These differences must be noted. G.R. Elton, the well-known Cambridge historian, has differentiated these types of historical works with clarity. According to him: 'Description attempts to display a manifestation of the past without giving it the dimension of a change of time.'[8]

'Analysis is still fundamentally static but sets the situation or thing described in a wider context of adjoining situations and things, studies interrelations, and attempts to establish causal connections and motives'.[9]

'Narrative tells the story and it is not material how long the time may be'.[10]

As has been pointed out, annals are Varshavrittanta i.e. they focus on happenings of each year while chronicles are Vritta-krama-varnana i.e. they undertake to deal with everything that takes place in succession. Biographies tell the story of a person to bring out his importance as one individual.

The chief function of history is to bring out the coherence and pattern of events that have taken place.

As Elton points out, "It is concerned with all human sayings, thoughts, deeds and sufferings which occurred in the past and have left present deposit; and deals with them from the point of view of happening, change and the particular."[11]

---

[8] Elton, G. R. The Practice of History, Fontana Library, 1957, p. 150.

[9] Ibid, p.150.

[10] Ibid. p.151.

[11] Ibid, P.24.

Chapter Five
History: Reference Hindustani Music

History, Music and Hindustan

It is customary to emphasize that chronology and geography are the two eyes of history. If this is taken very seriously then it must be admitted that in a country like India, both eyes seem to blink and considerably! In addition, one has to reckon with the characteristic Indian attitude towards recording of events, preservation of monuments and passing information on in an easy flow. It is hardly surprising that Elton was compelled to note that, "There is something markedly a-historical about the attitudes embedded, for instance, in the classic minds of India and China".[12]

It is symptomatic that despite the long and fertile tradition of works on musicology, Hindustani art music can scarcely boast of a neat attempt at music-history till the 19th century.

As a cumulative effect of all such factors, music-history demands to be construed as a history of musical ideas. The question may be asked: what is a musical idea and how is it to be identified? In brief, musical ideas can be defined as 'intellectual and emotional formulations of individuals or related groups about music, the ideas being assumed to have a performing potentiality at some point of time. These formulations determine the nature, quality and the course of music of the concerned culture.'

It is therefore imperative to seek history of music in the performing and scholastic traditions. The former is an ever-changing phenomenon while the latter presents a nearly consolidated, relatively stabilized and considerably codified statement of the former. Due to their respective inherent qualities, at any given point of time scholastic tradition inevitably lags behind performing traditions. Hence, in its ideal crystallization, music-history should be a coherent story of performing ideas. It is on the basis of these ideas that discussion-space would be allocated to individuals, places, books, works and dates etc. in the historical exposition. History of music can hardly be written as a collection of hero-stories or praise-songs about places! It must be noted that in actuality we show a clear preference for a 'living past when we distinguish between performing ideas and scholastic ideas arising there from. To quote the apt Elton again, "while history may commonly be thought of as the whole mankind's past life, it is, in truth, only the surviving past. Historical study is not the study of the past but the study of present traces of the past."[13]

---

[12] Elton, G. R. The Practice of History, Fontana Library, 1957, p.12.
[13] Ibid, P.20

The Nature of Reasoning in Music-history

One may begin the discussion of this theme by quoting from an ancient master-historian, Polybius:"... writers and readers of History ought to concentrate attention less upon the bald narrative of transactions than upon the antecedents, concomitants and consequences of any given action. If you abstract from History the 'Why' and the 'How' and the 'Wherefore' of the particular transaction and the rationality or reverse of its results, what is left of her ceases to be a science and becomes a tour de force which may give momentary pleasure, but is of no assistance whatever for dealing with future".[14]

A subtle change is noticeable in the manner of reasoning out solutions to queries raised in music-history chiefly because of the essential nature of music, performance and the performing idea as discussed earlier. For example, a comparatively secondary role is accorded to the role of causation, Music-history deals with a movement from a state or idea A to a state or idea B. The crux of the matter is that in a number of instances, B cannot be said to have been caused by A, even though B is subsequent, as well as adjacent to A. At least three other or alternative relationships are probable: coincidence, co-existence or merely being (temporally) sequential. Under the circumstances, even if music-history denies that things happen by pure accident, it cannot but appear to be a little tentative in this respect.

It must be noted that this is also because of another factor: the particular purpose or use that music-history is put to.

Generally, it is suspected that historical reasoning can also be notably vitiated because the historian himself has an inevitable impact on the material he deals with. It is argued that historical facts are, in fact, historian's facts! However, in my opinion the argument seems to flow from an unconscious adherence to the model of natural sciences, which are supposed to deal with objective facts! The position is uncalled for. Like any other investigator, the historian selects or chooses questions he wants to ask or raise and these questions decide what would be his 'facts or evidence.' To that extent, he is decidedly dealing with an interpreted reality. Under the circumstances the ultimate, i.e. an entirely objective history, could only be thought to be a theoretical possibility. All human investigations are human, and music-history is no exception.

Perhaps, with a non-representational reality such as music, it is inevitable that the inferred quality of exposition is more pronounced. Fortunately, no historical reasoning stops at selecting facts. Thus, after selecting facts a music-historian then

---

[14] Greek Historical Thought, ed. Toynbee, Arnold J., Mentor, 1952, pp. 135-136.

proceeds to employ facts to reconstruct the musical past, the temporal segment of which the facts constitute evidence. Hence, the full circle of the reasoning involved in historical exposition could be appropriately represented as a movement in a sequence: general bias → choice of question → selection of facts → reconstruction of the past.

This brief discussion should end with at least a mention of the paradox involved. The music-historian, as has been argued, reasons out a reconstruction of the past. However, it may be that the actual past did not correspond to such a rational construction. As Elton put it, 'the historian's most difficult handicap - much worse than any mere prejudice - lies in his inevitable hindsight'.[15]

What use music-history?

One may begin with an apt quotation from the ancient Polybius: "the essential elements in History are the consequences and concomitants of action, above all, its causes".[16]

Very often, the utility (if not the use-) of music-history is questioned, A special reference must be made to performers' customary attitude towards the discipline: What use is history?

A general answer is that human concern with the past is a widely shared characteristic and music too has a past and it is natural and logical to have an interest in history of music. Another answer is that study of history and history itself, exists as an intellectual pursuit and as such needs no additional ground to establish its utility. Yet another argument, pitched at a slightly practical level, holds that history is useful because it teaches us some lessons. As Elton impressively puts it, "it enlarges the area of individual experience by teaching about human behaviour, about man in relationship to other men, about interaction of circumstances and conditions in their effect upon individual and social fortunes".[17]

It is also argued that to understand a problem is to understand its history. So the key to the present is to be sought in history. As Donald N. Ferguson pointed out, "account of the past as an explanation of the way in which things of the present came to be as they are." - and hence history of music.[18]

Further, 'the Prophetic role' of history can also be hardly ignored. Present problems or problematic situations have a history and a close look at the latter illumines and assists in making decisions for tomorrow. History can at least be predictive if not prophetic.

---

[15] Elton, G.R. op.cit. p. 127.

[16] Greek Historical Thought, ed. Toynbee, Arnold J. Mentor, 1952 p. 136.

[17] Elton, G.R. op.cit. p.67.

[18] A History of Musical Thought, Routledge, Kegan Paul Ltd; London, Second Edition, 1948 p.vi.

Having mentioned all these grounds to justify study of history one must understand that like all other human inquiries the ultimate rasion-detre for music-history is that it represents an attempt to search for truth, which in itself, is a self-satisfying and self-justifying activity.

Coming to the performer's customary resistance to the study of music-history, it appears that this may be due to the two types of interpretations of history frequently put forward. The first type of historical interpretation could be described as the 'circular or cyclical' while the second could be identified as 'the linear or progressive'. The cyclical explanation seems to suggest that musical phenomena emerge and vanish to be replaced by others, which, in essence, however follow the same pattern. The other, linear version, argues that all past moves inexorably towards the present in a straight line of progress. There may of course be periods or phases when back-slides or deviations etc. are detected and the linear advance is thereby interrupted, but in the long run a historical view would indicate repeated course-corrections applied by musical geniuses who ensure a linear movement.

The point to be noted is that both these views create difficulties for performers. The first obviously denies them the credit of being 'innovators, epoch-makers, geniuses' etc. It suggests, that contrary to their aims and in spite of their dedicated pursuits of music over long periods - performers are merely destined to repeat what somebody may have already achieved, at some earlier period, perhaps at the same place (and also better!) The second, the linear interpretation is slightly more optimistic and makes some allowance for individual contributions to be registered as that. However, this interpretation implies a sort of cultural determinism or fatalism because it hints at an inexorable march of events towards a goal to be achieved in spite of errors, lapses or accidents. It sounds as if history makes and moulds individual talents, allows and affords scope to personalities to attain a goal known only to history - a goal that is only dimly surmised by human beings! In this way of thinking History seems to take the place of God!

However, it appears to me that performers can rest assured on this count. Their achievements can be recognized and registered in history and yet they can learn from historical reality because of the fact that music, as a manifestation, is essentially non-verbal, non-representative and contemplative in character.

In brief, it may be stated that performing arts (and features there in) do not die. Performance as a phenomenon needs a long period of gestation and projection to reach a state when it is accepted as 'qualitatively valuable'. Before performance is crystallized as such, numerous neuromuscular, psychophysical co-ordinations as well as evolutions of equations of legitimacy, all between individuals and society have to become real. Further, on account of the slow pace of human evolution, solutions to performing problems, (necessarily formulated in terms of performing components) retain their validity even though performing arts change almost continuously. In other words, study of music-history invariably helps performers to avoid the ordeal of beginning a quest for excellence *ab initio*.

An acutely observant performer would, on a majority of occasions, perceive that problems similar to his own have been tackled before, and situations corresponding to his own predicament have been handled before - by persons with aptitudes, attitudes and adroitness of no easy parallel. Performers soon realize that studies in music-history in reality make available to them an accumulated wisdom, or a philosophy in action of a cultural group to which he himself may (or may not) belong. Perusal of history would hence mean avoiding meaningless repetition or statement of approach to, and concern for, a particular problem.

Viewed in cultural perspective, performing problems need to reviewed, answers need to be reinterpreted and criteria need to be refined, so no traumatic and unnatural breaks are allowed to appear and affect cultural processes. Performers with this view of history are likely to subject themselves to the paradox of simultaneously having their egos lowered and boosted through their studies of music-history!

The Issue of Chronology
When an inquiry is narrowed to a particular manifestation such as Carnatic or Hindustani music, matters related to chronology raise awkward questions.

Firstly, there cannot be a particular date to mark beginning of a phenomenon such as music. At the same time, as they are known today, Hindustani and Carnatic music-s can hardly be described as ancient! Irrespective of the early use of the word Hindu/ Hindustan, the specific manner of music-making identified today as Hindustani cannot be placed earlier than the late middle ages - a period of numerous and major cultural changes in Indian history. It is educative to note that many scholars refer to Sangitasudhakara of King Haripaladeva of Anhilwad (Gujrat) as the first to distinguish between Hindustani and Southern systems of music in India.

It has been noted that for Haripaladeva, motivation for the undertaking was provided during his pilgrimage to the South and the entreaties of performers to write on Sangita!

The work is placed around 1248. To derive inspiration from the South to systematize music from Hindustan seems to be a recurring motif! Pundarik Vitthal (1556-1605) and Pt. V. N. Bhatkhande (1860-1937) are other and later major musicologists who provide glowing instances.

To return to the chronological aspect, Pt. Bhatkhande, the first major modern and Indian music-historian of the Hindustani system, apparently anticipated the logic of the argument put forward so far. Therefore, in his historical deliberation, he left alone the Hindu period. According to Bhatkhande's periodization, the Hindu period extended from the Vedic times to the 10th century A.D., respectively to be followed by the Mohammedan and the British periods. The Mohammedan period

spanned over eight centuries till the British power took firm roots in the country in the 18th century.

However, the foregoing argument I have put forward does not preclude reference to the pre-medieval scene. On occasions, calling attention to the past would point to the essential continuity of music as a performing tradition. It may also reveal significant addition to or substraction from the musical ideas. Cultural history abounds in instances of anticipations and atavisms - and both are not to be labelled as temporal aberrations. Musical ideas, forms, schools, instruments, methods, principles etc. display a notable tendency to lie low, or change surfacially or exhibit a mere terminological change, but not to disappear completely. In other words, a true historical perspective in the historical dimension makes it difficult to be entirely modern or pioneering; - let alone being a revolutionary!

Attention must be paid to the aspect of geography too when reference is made to the chronological divisions in the development of Hindustani art music.

How does one understand the word Hindustan?

Two definitions from Molesworth are worth noting.

"Hindu (P) = Black. Applied by the Persians to Ethiopians, black Arabians, Indians etc. [19]

Hindustan = (P) The country of the Hindus, Hindustan or India. The word is especially understood as the upper provinces or region to the north of the Narmada river. Hindustani is relating to the country.[20]

The territorial as contrasted with the cultural bias of the term is notable. The inescapable suggestion is to scan the map of the country to determine the areas in which Hindustani art-music effectively exists as a system in vogue. Even a cursory look at the contemporary India would indicate the following areas as practitioners of Hindustani art music:

Maharashtra, Haryana, Punjab, Himachal Pradesh, Jammu and Kashmir, Madhya Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Orissa, Bihar, West Bengal, Goa, Diu and Daman, Delhi, Chandigarh.

It needs to be pointed out that art music traditions in the North Eastern region pose some academic problems. The differences between Hindustani and North-Eastern performing traditions are too qualitative to be set aside despite terminological and performing parallels and correspondences.

It may be argued that what is radically different in this region is devotional music and not art music. However, it is to be noted that devotional music-s in Indian

---

[19] Molesworth Krit Marathi - English Shabdakosha, Shubhada Saraswat, Pune, 1957 (second edition), first published 1857. p.901.
[20] Ibid p.901.

regions usually consist of a stream which moves closer to art-music tradition prevailing in the area. It must be stated that the North-eastern devotional music might refer to countries and cultures outside the present political India.

The political divisions listed earlier to indicate the area of HAM (Hindustani Art Music) covers 2,38,000 - sq.km.-s and population-wise HAM would appear to hold sway over 48,990,7000 persons. This constitutes roughly 71.5% of the total population. The area puts to use 17 languages. If one takes into consideration broadcasting stations and movie-houses operating in the regions, one could imagine the staggering spread of HAM. Data on music-schools, classes, publications on music and the like would merely strengthen the impression.

Indeed, the magnitude of the geographical and chronological dimensions tempt one to follow the method of Alternate Chapters, so forcefully advocated by Polybius. He states, 'My own method has been to keep distinct from one another all the most important regions of the world and the transactions of which they have been respectively the theatres; to adhere in surveying them, to a fixed order of sequence; and to narrate within the limits, of each successive year, the contemporaneous events that occurred in it.[21]

In an attempt to clear ground for further discussion it is also worthwhile to note that what is understood as 'Sangita' today is much narrower than the traditional and the medieval idea of it. As Bhatkhande mentioned in his pioneering survey, 'To the Hindu mind the sister arts of Vocal music, Instrumental music and Dancing are so intimately connected with each other, that the term 'Sangita' was used by the ancient writers to include all the three together, although, I need hardly point out, it is applicable only to the first, namely, vocal music'.[22]

It would be obvious that this position has substantially eroded the scope of 'Sangit' and what it stands for. Bhatkhande might have some explanation for his stand, but as has been pointed out while discussing his immediate predecessors, they did not feel the need to do so as intensely as he did and the fact needs to be noted.

In passing, a word about the description 'Shastriya' - a term used to describe Hindustani art music. The English term 'classical' was (and unfortunately is!) used to describe Hindustani art music as a result of a confused reading of non-Indian terminology on art. The term 'classical' referred to a certain type of art conforming to certain rules in a certain period of Western art-history. 'Scientific', the other term often used to describe Hindustani art music by Bhatkhande and other pioneers was definitely a better indicator of the rule-structure-proneness of the music concerned. As Molesworth clearly explained, 'Used singly, it (Shastra) implied works of religion,

---

[21] Greek Historical Thought, op. cit., 1952 p.178.
[22] A Short Historical Survery of the Music of Upper India (A reproduction of a speech delivered by Pt. V.N. Bhatkhande at the first All India Music Conference. Baroda in 1915), Published by B. S. Sukhthankar, Bombay, 1984, p.2.

literature, or science in general, treatises upon the arts: it is therefore customarily connected with some other words to limit its application'.[23]

Existence and application of unwritten and often non-verbalized rules/ norms governing conception and performance of non-art categories of music such as folk, religious, primitive and popular prompts me to use the terms Shastriya in their context and Shastrokta (i.e. 'of which the science is spelt out') with reference to art-music. Yet another term Abhijat is more relevant in aesthetics than in musicology. Hence, it would enjoy a different specific field of operation.

It has been suggested earlier that the chief concern of music-historians should be ideas and performing ideas at that. This is easily said than achieved because such ideas very often remain non-verbalized and embedded in performance. They are therefore to be gleaned from the practice of the people, or to be identified from the behaviour pattern of the society under consideration.

To glean musical ideas from past cultures is of course a more difficult task. It is interesting to note that Thucydides opined that nothing but contemporary history is probable because in no other case facts are available. Fortunately, ideas have the innate capacity to be contemporary at all times!

In sum, music-history can become a reality if the net is cast wider and musicological perceptions are combined with cultural insights. As Donald N. Ferguson, a perceptive inquirer into history of music pointed out, "... the forms and the expressive values of music are to a great extent a result of the endeavour to represent through these forms a wide region of thought and feeling which is originally quite unrelated to music".[24]

He also points out to another possibility, "Music expresses feeling, and is thus related to other media of expression from which it may borrow, and by which it may to a large extent be conditioned. The music of the Greeks, to an extent hardly imaginable today, was conditioned by its intense association with its poetry."[25] Under the circumstances, inquiries into structural or grammatical peculiarities would hardly suffice to gain the necessary wider perspective. Consequently, it would be necessary to interpret the scholastic tradition would need to be interpreted in the context of some other themes related directly to music-making even though in varying degrees. It is therefore proposed that the following themes are kept in earshot while the lead provided by musicological texts is followed. It is contended that the proposed coupling of the thematic material with musicological data would enable a student to relate music to other life-areas even if no causal and inevitable relationship is assumed to exist between the two.

---

[23] Molesworth Krit, op. cit., p.786.

[24] A History of Musical Thought, op. cit., p. v.

[25] Ibid., p.vi.

The thematic pentad suggested is:

1. Patronage
2. Musical forms/genres (vocal and instrumental)
3. Musical instruments
4. Mobility of music and musicians
5. Relationship with language and other entertainment media.

The procedure would be to follow a rough chronological order in the Post Ratnakara period through works falling in the scholastic tradition. The works would have a more or less direct bearing on the thematic pentad.

This procedure would enable music-history to carry out two ostensibly contradictory functions: to talk about particular and yet to generalize; to be ideographic and nomothetic simultaneously. Obviously, musicological works would receive a priority but works on other life-areas would also be drawn upon in order to cover wider contexts. In addition, an attempt would also be made to consult musicological works from in the Prakrit Stream and, in fact, from major non-Sanskrit languages. It should be remembered that, after all, very few practicing musicians wrote on music in Sanskrit!

G. M. Young is once reported to have advised: read a period until you hear the people speak! In our case our aim should be to read the text fill we hear them sing!

Chapter Six
A Few Milestones in the History of Hindustani Music

The Twelfth Century

The first important text to be encountered is BharataBhashya by Nanyadeva of Mithila or Tirhut. In more ancient times, Videha was the kingdom of which Mithila and Vaishali were parts. In the 4th and 5th centuries it was known as Tirbhukti. During the Mughal period, the kings of Nepal occupied its entire northern portion and the part under Indian control was known as Tirhut (which formed a division of Bihar.) It comprised a large tract bounded on the North by Hajipur, Monghyr and Purnia.

Since ancient days, Mithila is reported to be marshy, densely forested and full of lakes, ponds and rivers. It has been mentioned that easy and abundant food, cool climate, ample leisure and peaceful government made it possible for the people to cultivate arts. One is reminded of Herodotus, the legendary Greek Historian who made an astute observation on the theme of environment and character. According to him, Cyrus the Great, of Persia originally enunciated the principle, 'Soft countries - invariably breed soft men and it is impossible for one and the same country to produce splendid crops and good soldiers.[26]

Mithila enjoyed Hindu rule for longer time because apparently the river Gandak secured Maithilian-s from Mohammedan invasion. Maithil rulers were known for their cultural accomplishments. It is worth noting that foundations of four of the six orthodox systems of Indian philosophy were laid in Mithila during the period spanning from 1000BC to 600BC. Gautama (Nyaya), Kanada (Vaisheshika), Jaimini (Mimamsa) and Kapila (Sankhya) are to be noted in this context. Vaishali rose to heights as a seat of Buddhist thought during the period 600BC to 300BC. However, Kumarila and Udayana worked to re-establish Brahmanical ascendance in the region.

Through the ages, Shiva, Shakti and Vishnu have roused the Maithil's devotion (hence, the Mithils customarily use three horizontal lines - symbolizing Shiva; the vertical, white sandal paste standing for Vishnu and the dot of red sandal on the forehead indicating the devotion to Shakti). However, the Shiva-worship is more widespread. Two kinds of Shiva-songs are popular: The Nachai-s and Maheshvani-s. The former form a class of purely devotional hymns and the latter describe the married life of Hara and Gauri in general. (This is why the Ain-e-Akbari (1598) noticed the Lacahari-s of Tirhut as a specialty.)

---

[26] Greek Historical Thought, op. cit., p. 143.

Equally prevalent is the Shakti-worship. Stories about the effectiveness of Shakti-worship and Siddhi-s (supernatural powers acquired through devotion etc.) are in wider circulation. This is a feature notably shared with Bengal and Assam. Maithili script and literature are also influenced by the Shakti-reverence. Tantric literature abounds and the script called Mithilakshara has developed in imitation of the tantric yantra-s (auspicious geometrical patterns of symbolic and mystic significance). A large number of songs such as Joga are based on pseudo-tantric beliefs and superstitions. There are also many Maithili Mantra-s used as charms etc.

It is a little surprising that despite a strong Vishnu-worship there is not much vernacular Vaishnava devotional literature; - not even Bhajan-s etc. The most common Maithili belief is that a Vaishnava is Virakta (uninterested in mundane affairs). One popular saying in Mathili runs in translation, to be one, who, though a Shakta, yet has given up the eating of fish and the Prasada (i.e. the meat offered to Shakti) of the goddess - such a person may as well put on a necklace of Tulsi beads'. The inference is obvious. The usually Epicurean Maithil prefers to avoid being a Vaishnava! The Maithils are tempted to use the vernaculars prevailing in the birthplaces of two of the greatest Vaishnava avatars, namely, Rama (Ayodhya) and Krishna (Mathura, Braj) to render Bhajan-s etc.

For a remarkably Brahmanical region, Maithils show a complete fusion of Hindu-s and Muslim-s. Brahmin-s have surnames such as Chaudhari, Khan or Bakshi. The Maithil musician Lochana is the first prominent Hindu writer on music to incorporate Iman and Firdausi raga-s. Maithili also has many Marsiya compositions.

Yet another perspective to Nanyadeva and music of his times is provided by Charyapada-s or Charyagiti-s practiced in Maithili and in the surrounding belt. Composed and circulated by the Buddhists of the Sahajiya cult during 10-12th centuries in Payar - Chanda, these compositions are 8 to 16 lines in length. Pt. Haraprasad Shastri notes that in old manuscripts, 18 Deshi Raga-s are indicated above the song. According to Amarkosha Charya means, 'to be on the right path, not to deviate from the rules of right and good conduct laid down by Buddha'. The Sahajiya cult advocated freedom of senses in order to attain the final salvation. Aware of the possibility of the strong hostility to such views, the songs expectably resorted to Sandhyabhasha (a language of the twilight?) i.e. a special double-meaning language. In fact, in the Charyapada-s a prototype of numerous contemporary metaphysical-erotic song-types performed in many regions is brought to our notice. It is worth noting that Jayadeva (c. 1120) of the Geetgovinda fame also reveals influence of the Sahajiya cult. When it is remembered that Vidyapati (14th century) and such other poet-composers also thrived under Jayadeva's influence, the Sahajiya musico-philosophical linkage becomes significant.

Nanyadeva (1097-1133), the first to be considered under our scheme, patronized musicians and systematized music. Maithil musicians were known to

have travelled into Tripura, Bengal and of course to Nepal and thus the music-spread becomes obvious.

Nanyadeva's elder brother Kirtiraj ruled over Varanasi and this too is an important fact in mapping the musical influences. As the two hailed from the south-based Rashtrakuta dynasty, the scene becomes challengingly complex. For the sake of convenience some Mithila-based items of interest from the later period may also be noted here, though in the strict order of discussion they will have to appear a little further on. Raja Harisimhadeva (1295-1323) was also known for his enlightened support. A work on dance, entitled 'Nritya-Vidya-Katha' is credited to him. In his court was Jyotireshwara who could be well described as the prominent member of the literati. Jyotireshwara (1280-1340) wrote important works, which we will have, occasion to refer to. Harisimhadeva fled to Nepal in 1324 and with him the center of musical activity shifted. Much later, Lochana (1681), commands attention for his important Raga Tarangini.

Bharatabhashya: Nanyadeva (1097-1133)

1) It is obvious that Nanyadeva stands out as a very early example of performer-patron-theoretician- a category as rare as that of Platuo's much sought - for philosopher-king! He seems to be a keen follower of the scholastic tradition as he refers to even Abhinavagupta (d.1030) - who could be described as a near contemporary of Nanyadeva.

2) Nanyadeva's allegiance to Bharata is well brought out in the title of his own work Bharatabhashya, even though two alternative titles, namely, Sarswat - hridayalankar and Saraswati-hridaya-bhushan are also mentioned with notable frequency. However, he does not hesitate to add to what Bharata states or to differ from him. It is therefore deducible that Nanyadeva wrote about music which, though had retained some features of the music from the Bharata tradition, was rapidly and perceptibly moving away from it.

3) The fact of Nanyadeva's deviance is of special significance because the work gives no indication of Islamic musical influence. Usually, names of Raga-s, instruments, musical genres carry many - sided suggestions of non-indigenous sources. Such sources, it must be added, can also operate through modes much milder than full-scale cultural invasion or confrontation, a fact we tend to overlook. Bharata-Bhashya, with its extensive treatment of Jati-s and Dhruva-s, clearly refers to an essentially non - Islamic musical corpus at a time when Muslims were about to secure a firm cultural foothold in India.

4) It could be maintained that in some highly technical respects, Nanyadeva's explanations point to features relevant to the practice of contemporary Hindustani art music. In addition, many items also exemplify deviations from the earlier i.e. the pre-Nanyadeva musical thinking. Some instances are noted below:

a) Nanyadeva improved upon the sequence of notes given in Naradiya - shiksha, the first musicological work to establish correlation between the Vedic notes (such as Krishta, Panchama etc.) and notes of the Saptaka (Shadja, Rishabha etc.). It is also to be noted that the Shiksha refers to the Dhaivata-Nishad sequence inversely. Hindustani music could not have been what it is today without a stabilized and ascending basic sequenc. It is this background that the importance of Nanyadeva's course-correction is to be appreciated.

b) Nanyadeva is an early example of a musicologist borrowing different concepts from grammarians holding to an older definition of music. According to the previous tradition, drama was largely a danced presentation and dance in its turn was a component of Sangita i.e. music. As a consequence, the concept of Abhinaya found a place in musicological deliberations. Today, music, dance and drama are differentiated more sharply. Instances of Nanyadeva's more accommodating position could be listed to make the point clear:

i) Grammarians employed concepts of Udatta and Udatta-tar (i.e. high and higher) notes. Nanyadeva introduced a parallel distinction between Krishta and Vikrishta. The Shiksha grantha-s do not refer to such distinction.

ii) Nanyadeva emphasized his musicological bias by stating that singers of Sama-s added Krishta and atiswara to the prevailing gamut of five notes to complete it.

iii) Nanyadeva registered an important deviation from Bharata when he used the term Sarana to refer to a kind of notation effected by movement and use of fingers of the hand.

iv) He described the three Grama-s by noting their initial notes and the ascending sequence. He also added that the Gandharagrama was not used by human beings because it was either too high or too low. Even though too much need not be read into it, Matanga, Abhinavagupta and Nanyadeva refer to Shadjagrama as Shadjapradhan, thus deviating from the Bharata sanctioned terminology and perhaps the accompanying musical usage.

v) The etymological explanation of Swara, given by Nanyadeva - is more musicological than that of Matanga who had relied on Patanjali's grammar to arrive at his definition. According to Nanyadeva, the definition is "Swayam Atmanam Ranjayati". According to Matanga, "Swayam Hi Rajate Yasmat Tasmat Swarah". Of course Matanga also refers to Kohala's definition which states, "Dhvani Raktah Swarah Smritah".

vi) Nanyadeva is the first to refer to two new intervals, namely, Kaishiki-gandhar and Kaishiki-nishad, later mentioned by Sharagndhara in Ratnakara. By all accounts, these intervals were subtle, sparingly used, slightly higher and were characterized by application notably oscillating or vibratory. The contemporary Hindustani terminology namely, Chadhi (higher) and Utari (lower) refers to specially augmented diminished pitch of notes such as Gandhar in Raga Darbari and Todi or of the note

Nishad in Puriya and Yaman. This is to be noted in the present context as a parallel concept.

vii) One of the functions of the Murchana was to help musical elaboration by making available a differently distributed octave - space. Nanyadeva refers to the full octave-length of the Murchana and not only to the ascending order - thus going a step beyond Matanga's seven-note Murchana.

viii) Bharata, Matanga and Nanyadeva describe 33 musical embellishments while Sharangdeva enumerated 63. In this way Nanyadeva represents an end of a line. Similarly, while Nanyadeva enumerates 7 Gamak-s, Ratnakara gives 15 and still later Somnath gives 19. Once again Nanyadeva indicates termination of an evolutionary phase. I suggest that the preponderance of Gamak-s is directly related to the type of chordophones in currency. It also denotes a freer and more complex manner of organizing the available tonal material.

ix) It is interesting to note that Nanyadeva is rather tentative in describing the harp-type of Vina such as the Vipanchi. On the other hand, his description of Ghoshak vina may suggest a single - note drone - an important element in Hindustani music. He also refers to a two stringed Vina called Alabu. In addition, he specifically declares that the 66 and 100 - string Vina-s were employed at the time of sacrifice.

x) Nanyadeva's definition of Vadi Swara is also accommodative in that it includes in it, the functions of Graha and Nyasa. The fact suggests use of a less restrained music making often described as Anibaddha.

xi) Nanyadeva notes Rasa-Swara equation in case of Rishabha and Dhaivata (both Komal), Tivra Ma, Gandhar and Nishad (both Kaishiki) - though this has no sanction of the earlier tradition. Obviously, this was an extended application of the Rasa-theory at Nanyadeva's own initiative.

This brief discussion of Nanyadeva's Bharatabhashya was intended only to illustrate the gradual but perceptible change Indian music was undergoing during the eleventh-twelfth century - as if in preparation for the great bifurcation of the Indian musical impulse. Various regional forces, Muslim invasions and migrations were to cumulatively contribute towards a complex and considerable later enrichment of the musical scene in the subcontinent.[27]

Jyotireshwara in Mithila

At this point it would be instructive to attend to Jyotireshwara who adorned the court of Raja Harisimhadeva (1295-1323).

Jyotireshwara outlived his patron; - a fact to be noted, because, that meant he could reach deeper in the culturally critical medieval period. His Varna -

---

[27] I have relied on Bharatabhashyam, ed. Desai, Chaitanya. Indira Kala Sangit Vishwavidyalaya Khairagadh, India, 1951.

ratnakara contains prose descriptions of day-to-day life.[28] The sixth chapter, titled 'Description of Bhata etc.' refers more directly to music. One notes that the entire compendium, a commentary on the medieval Indian culture, reveals no influence of the coming of the Turks.

Another work by the same author in effect rolls back the history of Maithili drama to some extent. 'Maithili Dhurta samagama', a farce, is the first specimen of what finally developed into Kirtaniya in Maithili. In this farce, songs in Maithili, a Prakrit language, are not introduced in accordance with the Sanskrit dramaturgical practice. Thus, characters from the highest as well as the lowest strata employ Maithili. Also significant is the fact that one musico-erotic composition. modelled in all probability on Jayadeva, finds a place. This, again is a departure from the Bharata-pattern of having a song to mark off entry-exit-speech situations according to norms laid down.

Coming back to Varnaratnakara, it would be helpful to remember that the work belongs to an older tradition of composing literary works in which set formulae and prepared descriptive passages are introduced to embellish narratives. It has been pointed out that the evidence in Jain canons traces this compositional type back to 500 BC. In the Ardhamagadhi Sutra-s, such descriptive passages are called Vanna i.e. Varnaka, and they are to be commonly found in Jain literature. Usually, the passages are not quoted in full. The text suggests that the descriptive passage is to be introduced at the place indicated by the rubric 'commonly'. The reader is expected to know it by heart. In the Sanskrit commentaries, the explanation of the passage, where the Vanna-s are to be introduced, is given with phrase such as 'Samprati Asya Nagarya Varnakam Aha| Aupapatika Granthaprasidhha-Varnaka-Parigraha'. As is known, Puranik-s, i.e. narrators of mythological tales, used such works. The point is that the work under discussion gives us an idea of the sequence or arrangement of a subject treated in an orally delivered composition.

From the first Kallola, are preserved descriptions of lower castes, criminal tribes, as well as beggars and mendicants.

From the fifth Kallola, consisting of forest-descriptions, we get a list of 16 tribes and a reference to haunting/ enchanting songs of the Kinnara-s and Gandharva-s.

In the sixth Kallola, a professional singer and master is called Vidyadhara. In addition to the customary listing of Raga-s, Sruti-s etc., 14 types of singing merits-demerits and 7 of defective singers are mentioned. Three sections are devoted to dance. Ten qualifications of drum-players, 12 kinds of drums, 10 Rasa-s are also noted. At the end, twenty-seven kinds of Vina-a are mentioned.

---

[28] Varnaratnakara of Jyotireshwara-Kavi Shekharacharya ed. - Chatterjee, Sunitikumar and Mitra Babua; Royal Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta 1940.

In the seventh Kallola, 72 princely families are catalogued. Place-names such as Murabhanja, Gomanta, Gandharva, Vardhana and Khurasana appear. The last should obviously alert us to detect a contact with Islam.

A non-musicological work often gives musical information that has percolated to strata furthest removed from those expected to be directly related to music. It also indicates musical stereotypes assimilated in language, literature and other records of culture.

Ghunyat - ul-munya (1374-75)[29]

The next important work to be considered is singled out by Prof. Shahab Sarmadee as the earliest known Persian work on Indian music. Once again we have an unknown author who compiled a tome for a discerning and demanding patron - in this case, Mailk Shamsuddin Ibrahim Hasan Abu Raja, the Naib of Gujrat for about three years from 1374. According to the self-effacing author, the Naib 'found relaxation in listening to the Persian Sama and Hindavi Sarud'.

It is interesting to note that in this work, the patron is specifically mentioned as conversant with, and a connoisseur of both Sama-I-Parsi (i.e. Persian music) and Sarud-I-Hindi (Hindustani music). The unknown author has noted in the preface that the work was a result of assistance received from language experts and performers invited for the purpose by the patron. Further, it is mentioned that the task became necessary because the elite could not otherwise appreciate the highbrow music and stylized dance. It is to be noted that the reigning monarch, Ferozeshah Tughlaq was known for his passion for religious conformism and yet he initiated many translations from Sanskrit into Persian. The fact only points at the confluence of two cultures taking place at that time; - one Perso-Arabic and the other basically Indian i.e. Hindu. The author recognized the distinctness of the two musical streams (related to the two cultures) but also clearly noted the trend towards affinity between the two. The author is credited with another work entirely devoted to the study of the Perso-Arabic stream. The work titled Qism-sarud-i-Parsi is said to have been preserved in a library in Pakistan.

Sarmadee, the editor of the work, surmises that the author may have been born during the closing years of Allauddin Khilji's reign (1314-15) when Amir Khusro was alive and was reportedly at the height of his fame. The text specifically mentions seven Sanskrit musicological works, namely, Natyashastra, Brihaddeshi, Ratnakara, Sangita Ratnavali, Sangita Binod, Ragarnava and Sangita Mudra. From these, the last three are not traceable and Sangita Ratnavali is hardly identifiable.

With the help of the editor's brief introduction some content analysis can be attempted:

---

[29] Ghunyat-ul-Munya, ed. Sarmadee Shahab, Asia publishing house, Bombay, 1978.

1) The first major feature of this post-Ratnakara work is that it follows the Ratnakara philosophy of keeping the contemporary practice in view - often in defiance of the authoritative, Sanskrit musicological works.

2) It is symptomatic that the work prefers the prevalent Prakrit terms to the Sanskrit (e.g. Sur instead of Swara, Bin instead of Vina).

3) Frequently, the author mentions a form, a Tala etc. and goes on to state categorically that it has gone out of vogue. For example, 'Math - of its six Tala-s, only three are in vogue'. Or, 'Parmaath - all the five varieties of it have now become obsolete'. 'Rupaka, besides the fact that every melodic composition cannot be categorized as Saliz-Sul-Rupaka, there is a particular form of it known as Rupaka, nowadays.'

4) Apart from giving illustrations of instruments, an important organological feature is the author's attention to the performing practice, which attracts notice. For example, see the statement: 'also the Danda (finger board) of the Bin has been nowadays made larger than it used to be according to the rules laid down'. This particular detail would obviously indicate more extensive use of Meend, Ghaseet and other similar embellishments and generally a projection of music with a pronounced tonal density and nuance.

5) The author provides a vital clue to the medieval notion of 22 Sruti-s and their grouping into 12 Swarasthana-s. He discusses the Sruti - issue with reference to both vocal and instrumental musical practice. To quote, 'In accordance with the actual practice it so appears to me that the seven Sur-s, which emanate from the human throat have each a point of origin of their own, called Than (Sthana). Each point of origin of a note has an expanse of its own. In this expanse the seven Sur-s are produced in three relative pitches: Madra, Maddh and Tar. When a song is to be uttered the Sur of the desired pitch is pronounced. This in fact is termed as Surit and not the one which is a component of Sur'. Adding that the 21 sruti-s are seen on the frets of the Bin, he further explains that the very same note which is produced from a string unstopped is recognized as the 22nd Sruti. The author's observation that the intervals are Mutasawi i.e. 'absolutely equal' suggests an interesting speculation: was this a precursor of the 12 equidistant semitones in their Indian avatar? Sarmadee rightly points out that the Sur-Parda synthesis is a direct step to Raga- Maqam approximation.

6) A related important observation brings to notice the drone phenomenon. The author states that Sruti is not that which is the constituent of the Sur but that which emanates from a particular Maqam of note-origin which leads to a harmonic production of seven Sur-s. As he calls it (the drone) Kharij (Kharaj), the reference suggests a feature in existence even today.

7) It is to be noted that the work deals with singing, instrument - playing and dancing in accordance with the traditional definition of the word Sangita.[30]

8) The author who preferred Amal (practice) to Ilm (theory) anticipates Bhatkhande et al.

From Mithila to Gujarat was a long journey. The next detour would have taken us to Rana Kumbha of Rajasthan and his Sangitaraj. However, it seems advisable at this point to retrace our steps a little and discuss the larger setting of the period which obviously emerges as critical for discussing Hindustani art music.

The nineteenth century European thinkers described the period from 476 AD to 1533 AD as the Middle Ages. The dictionary meaning of the word 'middle' is of course innocuous. 'Anything so placed as to have the same quantity or number on each side' is described as middle. The second word in the term is 'age' meaning period of existence or of time'. Again there is nothing disturbingly qualitative about the usage. However, brought together, the words connote a period of stagnation, if not a decline, anarchy if not a chaos, and a certain weakening if not a total loss of values. In other words, the term 'middle ages' has acquired a derogatory tone. In view of this general thrust, an indiscriminate or an unqualified use of the term becomes suspect.

A note of dissent needs to be sounded specifically in case of India. Firstly, as Hazariprasad Dwivedi has argued, the Indian way of periodization is not secular. Therefore, terms such as Madhya-Yuga and Madhya-Kala are alien to the Indian mind. The Indian tradition is to refer to such time - spans as Krita, Treta, Dwapara and Kali yuga-s. Indian thinkers have also determined that the Kaliyuga has already commenced at the end of the Aryan king's reign i.e. by 1000 AD. An earlier opinion in this regard placed the commencement of the Kaliyuga on the 13th February 3102 BC!

The present age is the Kaliyuga. Contrary to general belief, the age is not traditionally described as an altogether dark age. In fact, it is as if the human beings live in it with an advantage, because in it, even though Manasa-Punya (loosely speaking good thought/ intention) is rewarded, Manas-Papa (opposite of the good thought) is not punished!

Leaving aside the rather metaphysical differentiation, it is more important to accept that a long period of about one thousand years can hardly be dismissed as culturally inferior. It is true that during the period, India was plagued by political anarchy for considerable stretches of time and in many places. However, it is also an accepted fact that during this period religion, arts, literature and many other areas registered new beginnings as well as identifiable phases of recognizable and meritorious fruition. The turmoil, however trying it may have been for the

---

[30] Ibid. For this exposition I am also grateful to the Late Prof. Sarmadee with whom I had discussions on the theme of Creative Middle Ages in India.

contemporaries, moved them and their culture towards an unforeseen synthesis. Hence, a fresh evaluation of the age is surely warranted.

Some music-related features of the period can be briefly notes here:

1) By 1000 AD, the religious landscape was changing very fast. New cults and their cultural manifestations were making a strong impact. The most noticeable common trait could be described as determined deviations from the Veda-s.

2) A very significant contribution of the period is the remarkable development of various non-Sanskrit languages and literatures.

3) By 1000 AD temples had largely replaced the sacrificial altars. It should be obvious that artistic expressions connected with the two are of different kinds and types. Temples enjoyed sizeable land grants and they became rich centres of patronage. The temple-traditions were later to be strengthened by the Math-s (monasteries).

4) From the 7th century onwards the entire expanse of the land came increasingly under the influence of various devotional sects. These sects invariably chose to employ music as one of the chief vehicles of devotion. The Indian 'Saint - poet - composer - singers' achievements in music and culture can hardly be overlooked while assessing the overall musical culture of the Indian people. The contribution of the category of devotional music (of which religious music is the parent category) towards the widespread musical literacy in the land is incomparable.

5) As suggested earlier, a major trend of the newly emerging religious sensibilities was to deviate from the Veda-s. Hazariprasad Dwivedy has perceptively noted that the advent of Islam in India compelled a somewhat neat bi-polarization of religious communities between Hindu and the Muslim faiths. As a consequence, the non-Vedic sects were forced to make a choice between the reformed Brahmanized Hinduism and Islam. In other words, conversions resulted because of the intensity of pressures demanding religious conformity to either of the two poles. To quote Dwivedy (in translation), 'The non Vedic sects tended increasingly to prove their conformity with the Veda-s after the tenth-eleventh century. Both Shaiva-s and Shakta-s did so. However, some sects were so fanatically anti Vedic that they could not be legitimized by any of these Mata-s. They gradually converted to Islam. At a cursory glance it would appear that sects having Muslim Yogin-s are even today those who were Shaiva-s to begin with and they were legitimized by Gorakshanath'.[31]

6) In the context of the totality of artistic expression, a very significant aspect of the devotional cults is their move to formulate works on philosophy and aesthetics/poetics in support of their respective artistic/aesthetic practices.

---

[31] Madhyakalin Dharmasadhana, Sahitya Bhavan, Allhabad, 1970, 4th, edition, pp. 80-81.

7) A close examination of the cultural scene reveals that the concept of avatar-s went hand in hand with the devotional temper. It is to be recorded that though the number of avatars has stabilized at ten over the ages, the number has oscillated between 6 to 38.

A related matter is the way devotion is expressed.

The modes of expressing devotion stabilized at nine, with one third of them connected with singing. Further, from the ten avatar-s, Ram and Krishna became conducing to art on account of their Leela-Bahutva. Of the two, Krishna-avatar gained in popularity from 400 AD onwards, with Radha (Krishna's consort) also gradually gaining in stature. Leela is a phenomenon intrinsically helpful to creation of roles and characters; - a prime feature of performing arts. Leela, it would be understood, is a multiplicity of potential relationship of the devotee with the deity. As Tulsidas said, 'Tohi Mohi Nate Anek Maniye Jo Bhave'. The linkage between the Saguna devotion and performing arts is obvious.

8) From amongst the various Bhava-s (i.e. psychological relationships between the deity and the devotee), the Kanta - Bhava came in greater acceptance during the period.

9) The entry of Islam and its practitioners in India is to be understood against this background. Gaining entry first as traders, followers of Islam became politically dominant forces during the period in large parts of the country and continued to be so until they were effectively challenged by Hindu-s such as Maratha-s or Rajput-s, etc. Finally, the British subjugated them.

In fact, the role of Islam in India needs to be discussed in the perspectives offered by three aspects. They are political chronology, details of exchanges between Perso-Arabic & Hindavi music-s via the Muslims and contribution of the Sufi-s.

Chapter Seven
Political and Cultural Backdrop

The Muslim Political Backdrop

It has already been pointed out that a direct debate about Hindustani art-music need hardly concern itself about the Medieval period. If one is to justify such a reference on grounds of conceptual back tracing, then the referring back should inevitably stretch into the hoary past. However, the desirability and validity of doing so becomes inevitable only if Indian, and not Hindustani art music, is at the center of inquiry. But the present brief is limited in scope.

The period (medieval) is generally described as Mohammedan. However, it is necessary to note that people with the earliest Islamic association i.e. the Arabs, were in contact with India even in their pre-Islamic days. But so far there is no data suggesting a close musical exchange between resident Indians and the trading Arabs from that period. The Arabs were in contact with (coastal western) India from Sindh downwards. By the middle of the 8th century the Arabs were assiduously studying Indian lore and learning. It appears that their predominant Indian bias continued till the middle of the thirteenth century as afterwards a Greek tilt became more pronounced.

To anticipate the later argument, it is necessary to note that the emergence of Hindustani art music became possible after the pre-medieval Indian music passed through certain stages of transformation and development in which many Indian and non-Indian cultures took active part. As has been suggested, initially the non-Islamic Arabs and then the Islamic Arabs, were engaged in cultural exchanges with the then existing Indian traditions, constituting the first phase of development towards the final emergence of Hindustani art music. This stage can be described as the Indo-Arabic. This phase lasted till the beginning of the 11th century. During the next phase a gradual waning of Arab influence was noticeable, because the Arabs themselves were moving closer to Greek perceptions. As far as India was concerned cultural exchanges with Persia were becoming frequent, wider as well as qualitative. This phase could be described the Indo-Persian. Beginning from the end of the 11th century, this phase lasted till the late 15th century. (In this context is it not significant that no important musicological work was produced/written in Sanskrit during the period 1300-1400?) From then on, Hindustani art music gradually crystallized to what it is today. And it is perhaps poised for a dramatic change again!

Around the same time, i.e. the 9th century, the Sufi-s secured a firm foothold in India. The Sufis' manifest and unambiguous love for music was surely a contributory factor in their successful as well as continuous spread in the subcontinent. The Sufis accepted many indigenous customs and manners and a

number of these were conducing to music. For example, the followers of Nizamuddin Chishti (d.1324) included Basant and Rang celebrations in their religious practices. Similarly, in the times of Kaikubad (1287-1290) both Farsi and Hindi songs found place in performances.

However, this is anticipating a little. Muslim India, Mohammedan period or Islam in India enjoyed a complex, long and eventful career and ultimately it became part of the Indian cultural ethos. This did not happen suddenly, nor did it happen with all followers of Islam who came to India. The following chronology of the major political contours of Islam in India would help bringing out the complex pattern of the career of Islam in India as also to relate Islam in India to more specific musical features considered later:

632: Hazrat Muhammad Paigambar dies.

660: Ali, Paigambar's s son-in-law, was assassinated. His followers are known as Shiya-s.

711: First Muslim invasion in Sindh by Arabs. Repeated invasions took place but the reign was unstable.

871: Arabs settled in India, became independent from the Khaliph-s in Arabia.

998-1030: First Islamic dynasty to exercise permanent rule was established by Sebuktigin Ghazanavid of Turkish origin. His son Mahmud, invaded India 17 times to amass booty. He was a Sunni and ran the Administration on Iranian lines. Persian was the court language. Sunni theologians and Persian poets immortalized him. Punjab, Sindh, Khurasan and Iran were under his rule.

1203: Ghurids succeeded Ghazanavids. This was an indigenous dynasty from Central Afghanistan. Extended rule to Benaras and Bengal.

1210: Under Shamsuddin Iltumush Delhi became the capital and a major center for the Sultanate for 150 years to come.

1258: The Abbasiya dynasty fell in Baghdad and this led to a cultural break from various Baghdad-centered traditions. In fact, after the fall of Baghdad, Delhi became a refuge for Islamic scholars from elsewhere as they were running away from the Mongols. Iltumush was an Ilbari Turk and had eight successors.

1290: Ilbari dynasty was replaced by Khilji-s who provided six rulers. Islam pressed forward into the Deccan. The decline of the Khilji-s brought on a period of internecine warfare and rebellion. Tughlaq-s tried to stem the tide but failed.

1336: In the south Harihar and Bukka establish the Vijayanagar dynasty. This was a Hindu dynasty that acted as a power - center opposed to the growing Islamic influence.

1347: Hasan Gangu, a refugee from Iran and reportedly a friend of Amir Khusro founded the Bahamani dynasty in South India.

1398: Tamerlane arrives on the scene. The Sultanate disintegrated. Sayyad-s and Lodi-s came to power in Delhi. The latter were from an Afghan tribe.

1489-1517: Sikandar Lodi shifted capital to Agra to contain rebellious Hindu and Muslim chiefs. His successor was Ibrahim Lodi (1517-26). Both weakened the Afghan strata through their administrative measures. The Afghan civil war actually made it possible for the Mongols to emerge as a force.

1490: By this time the Bahamani dynasty cracked up and five Muslim dynasties emerged in the South each offering a base for further cultural exchanges. Depending on their Sunni/ Shiya loyalties, these dynasties were more or less disposed towards arts in general and music in particular. While tracing the role of Islam in India, it helps to remember that Islam - connected developments in the North by themselves cannot complete the story of Indian Islam!

1526: Zahiruddin Muhammad Babur (1483-1530), ruling in Kabul defeated Ibrahim Lodi at Panipat to establish Mongol rule in India. The following year he also subjugated the combined might of Muslims and Rajputs. Extended boundaries up to Bihar.

1538-45: Shershah Suri, an ambitious Afghan soldier defeated Humayun, Babur's son, who fled to Persia.

1555: Humayun seized Delhi. The Sur dynasty was thus short-lived. Humayun died in 1556 and Akbar (1542-1605) established in India the Mongol power, truly and firmly.

1561: Akbar conquered Malwa.

1562: He married the Rajput princess (from the Amber clan) located near Jaipur, abolished the conventional enslavement of war - prisoners and remitted pilgrimage - tax levied on Hindus.

1568-73: Akbar annexed many Rajput kingdoms.

1572: Conquered Gujarat.

1585: Conquered Gujarat and annexed Kashmir.

1590: Conquered Sindh.

1595: Conquered Kandahar.

1599: Moved to conquer the Deccan and the Portugese, but failed. Could subjugate only Ashirgadh and Ahemadnager.

1580-1626: Ibrahim Adil Shah's (II) reign in Bijapur marks a cultural counterpoint to Akbar's accomplishments in the North.

1605: Akbar died. Salim Jehangir succeeded.

1610: Ahmednagar asserted independence under the Ethiopian general Malik Amber.

1621: Abbas Safavai of Persia recovered Kandahar.

1627: Prince Khurram Shahajahan succeeded Jehangir. Took back Ahemadnagar as well as the Shia dynasties of Bijapur, Golkonda.

1657: Shahajahan fell ill seriously, and died in captivity in 1666.

1658-1681: Aurangzeb devoted attention to the North, introduced anti-Hindu, puritanical and Sunni favoreing measures.

1681: Aurangzeb turned attention to the Deccan, conquered Bijapur, and Golkonda.

1689: Executed Sambhaji, Shivaji's son.

1707: Aurangzeb died in the Deccan, unable till the end to defeat the Maratha-s. Muazzam, son, ascended to the throne at the age of 66!

1739: Nadir shah, the Persian conqueror sacked Delhi. Sindh, Kabul and Western Punjab were ceded to him.

1747: Nadirshah was assassinated. His Afghan general Ahemadshah Abdali invaded Punjab and Kashmir 7 times.

1757: Abdali sacked Delhi and Mathura.

1757: The British defeated the Mogal governor of Bengal at Plassey: Independent kingdoms were established in: Hydrabad Deccan, Arcot, Mysore, Bhopal, Oudh and Rohilkhand.

1761: Abdali defeated Maratha-s at Panipat.

1799: British killed Tipu Sultan.

1801: Arcot taken over.

1803: The British took Shah Alam II under protection.

1856: Oudh annexed.

1857: War of Independence.

Only Hyderabad (Deccan), Rampur, Bhopal/Tonk and Junagadh survived as native states under the British umbrella.

Juxtaposition of the Political and the Cultural

The political backdrop though important becomes useful only when cultural data is placed alongside. The present purpose is to make sense of the musical scene of the Hindustani variety and hence following and similar facts need to be noted:

- The court life of the Delhi sultans was largely modelled on that of the Seljna Sultanate of Persia. The main tenet was 'King is God's shadow on earth.
- Balban (1266-87) introduced the non-Islamic form of salutation called Sijda (religious prostration). This was also called Jamin - bos, Pa-bos. His son called Sheik Usman and Sheik Kadva (son of Sheik Bahauddin Zakariya) and arranged a Sama in his court.
- Kaikubad (1287-1290) was obviously a great lover of music. Many Gazal, kaul, kaulani-s were composed in his praise. In his court both Farsi and Hindi songs were sung.
- Administrative measures of Allauddin Khilji (1296-1316) and Mohammed bin Tughlaq catapulted many Turkish into the ruling elite. Land and sea merchants received new prestige because of their wealth and foreign contacts. However, by the end of the 13th century, Turkish predominance was eroded.

During Allauddin's reign a performing caste from Gujarat, the 'Parmar', came to Delhi in great numbers and settled in the capital.

- Giyasuddin Tughlaq's (1320-1325) mother was a Jat and his father a Turk. He arranged for a discussion in which legitimacy of the Sufi Sama was discussed.
- Muhammad Tughlaq (who ruled from 1325-51) had employed 1200 musicians and over thousand poets, writing in Hindi, Arabic or Persian. His artists faced death penalty if they performed elsewhere!
- Akbar's reorganization of the civil and the military services into Mansabdari (rank) enabled him to assimilate the Central Asian, Persian, Muslim and non - Muslims in to a coordinated system. Rivalries were therefore directed against group-leaders. Hence, a continued factionalism at the secondary level became a permanent feature. This has a direct relationship with a multiplicity of patronage-seats.
- Women played part in political intrigues etc. Wives of prominent Mongol courtiers often became scholars, patronized poets, founded schools and took part in politics. They also rode horses, played polo and took part in lion-hunts. Hindu princesses in Badshah's harem, (during Akbar's times) contributed to inclusion of Ganesh, Saraswati etc. in the Dhrupad compositions as also the Nayika-bheda manifestations (the eight types of heroines depicted in Sanskrit poetics). Nauroz, Holi, Divali - all were celebrated with enthusiasm.
- Akbar added many Timurid customs. The most important was the concept that Muslims and Hindus were like brothers and both were children to the emperor. He introduced the custom of Darshan i.e. appearing before the assembled crowd early in the morning, either on the balcony or at the window. Petitions could be

directly submitted to him at this time. Beneath the window gladiatorial combats could also be held.

He would greet the Sun while nobles would stand on a raised ground, and the commoners gathered below, thus representing a hierarchical picture of his universe! Aurangzeb discontinued the practice of Darshan as it smacked of human worship.

- From the time of Akbar, a large drum was played to announce to the crowd the Emperor's appearance. It is interesting to note that we have a miniature painting today which depicts Akbar as a child fighting for a drum!
- Akbar also introduced two new forms of salutation: Kornish (the right palm on forehead and head bent downwards), Taslim (the back of the right hand to touch the ground and then raised gently till the person stood erect.)
- Ulema-s, Sayyads & Sufis - were respected not in their own right but on account of their influence on the government and also because of their richness as they received many revenue-free grants, Under the Sultans as well as under the Mongols, converted or Indian-born Muslims tried to invent foreign parentage.
- In the Southern Islamic bases, the situation was different and equally complex, with notable socio-cultural consequences.

For example, in Maharashtra and the surrounding regions Delhi - based Muslim rule was replaced by the Bahamani-s by the middle of the fourteenth century (1347 AD). As far as cultural contacts/ exchanges were concerned, this was, by itself, a crucial event. Firstly, Delhi sultanate was interested in the Deccan only materially and militarily. On the other hand, the Bahamani-s, being Deccan-based had greater stakes in the region. Secondly, the Bahamani-s reigned longer, for about 125 years. Thirdly, the rulers, even though they had their capital initially at Daulatabad, soon shifted it to Gulbarga (in Andhrapradesh) and still later to Bidar. This brought about a greater intra-regional circulation - a process that was strengthened and hastened by the rise of Vijayanagar power (1330) and still later by the disintegration of the Bahamani dynasty into five kingdoms: - Shahi-s as they are known. It is to be noted that the stabilization of Bahamani rule led to an influx of a great number of foreigners of Persian, Mesopotamian, Abyssinian and Arabian origin. These foreigners used to enter through Dabhol, Chaul and Goa on the Western coast and very often there were practicing poets, litterateurs, artists, artisans and religious sectarians in search of careers and / or new converts.

The continued influx of alien talent must have created complications in maintaining evenness in the social structure. When one refers to Islam in India and the final emergence of Indian Muslims as a cultural component, one can hardly overlook regional variations. In the South, Muslims suffered a tripartite division into Delhi based, Deccan - based and 'foreigners' the last were called Garib uddiyar and Afaqi-s. The Bahamani reign was constantly plagued by continued conflicts between the latter two ostensibly on political grounds but obviously cultural friction could not be ruled out.

The Indo-Persian phase of evolution of Indian music towards Hindustani art music is seen very clearly in what happened in the Southern theatre.

When the Vijayanagar power emerged on the scene in 1330 the situation naturally became more complex. In an age where royal patronage was the main support for arts etc. it was inevitable that artists, scholars began making a beeline to Vijayanagar. In all probability the Vijayanagar support proved instrumental in the progressive consolidation of a musical tradition purposefully formulated and consciously viewed as a Hindu tradition, in contrast to the changing, modernized and Muslim-influenced version of prevailing music which I have referred to as the Indo-Persian. According to some, the former culminated in music identified later as Carnatic music (though there are others who would like to argue that it is the Carnatic music which shows more of the Indo-Percian musical thinking which came to India!)

The fact of the gradually intensifying and significant polarization between the Indo-Persian and the earlier Indian expression during the fourteenth century is well brought out by the Biruda controversy. A dispute arose in the predominantly Hindu-Dravid kingdom of Vijayanagar about the origin of the term Biruda. The question was whether it had a Mlenccha or an Aryan origin. The controversy is an indication that the prevailing cultural confrontation was not taking place between Aryan-Dravid but between Hindu-Muslim, with Dravid-s now being equated with Hindu-s. The polarization process continued unabated till the seventeenth century because Muslim rule of one or other dynasty continued in the Deccan.

It is claimed that South India had its distinctive musical tradition even before the advent of the Muslims. However, the fact that the terms Carnatic and Hindustani were reportedly used for the first time in the fourteenth century (in Haripaladeva's Sangita Sudhakara written between 1309-1312) shows that it is only after the Muslims struck roots in the Deccan that the musical polarization was completed' and recognised as that.

However, the kingdom and reign of Vijayanagar and the cultural influence it wielded does not lie within the ambit of our study. Further, data on region under the Bahamani-s is unfortunately inadequate to reconstruct a coherent picture of musical life. However, it can be said that perhaps it was in Vijayanagar that attempts were being made to forge a new relationship between musical practice and scholastic tradition. It is instructive to note that Vidyaranyaswami, associated with the founding of Vijayanagar dynasty (initially called Vidyanagar) is known to have collected musicians from all over the country to systematize the then available fifty Raga-s into fifteen Mela-s and document the system in his work called Sangita Sara. Unfortunately, the work is not available but later authors have quoted it. This was the first time that a system of originating i.e. Janak Mela-s and generated i.e. Janya Raga-s was employed in relation to Indian music. Vidyaranyaswami died in 1386. Acharya Brihaspati has cogently argued that Vidyaranyaswami's effort is to be interpreted as a direct response to the incoming Makam system of Persia. This seems quite plausible as in the South, and especially in Deccan, the Persian mode of Islamic

culture was ascendant. The Bahamani-s favoured Persian language and literature and there was a continuous contact between Bahamani and Persian courts. Kallinath, the well-known decoder of early musical tradition, was in the court of a later Vijayanagar king, called Nimmidi Devcaraya (1446-1465). He refers to Mela-system in such detail that it is fair to conclude that at least a hundred years must have elapsed since the ancient Jati-system of Indian art-music had been replaced by the Makam-oriented/ influenced Mela-system. Kallinath's testimony carries immense weight because Kallinatha's commentary on Sharangadeva almost re-enacted Abhinavagupta's achievemenent in interpreting Bharata.

To carry the story a step further, we should note that Ramamatya in his Swaramelakalanidhi (1550) continued the process initiated by Vidyaranyaswami. Consequently, he constructed a system of 16 Mela-s and 64 Raga-s. Ramamatya was related to King Ramaraja of Vijayanagar. The Mela-principle was applied with more and more vigour and rigor in times to come. Hence, we have Somnath in Ragavibodha (1610), an Andhraite (i.e. a Southerner) who refers to 23 Mela-s and 76 Raga-s. Finally, Venkatmakhi, in his Chaturdandiprakashika (1620) laid down a system of mathematically determined system with 72 Mela-s, a codification which Carnatic musical system swears by even today.

In view of the easy cultural circulation taking place in the region what is deducible from the Vijayanagar-centered musical culture is relevant in reconstructing the musical past of Hindustani art music. There is interesting documentary proof of cultural spread-over and personnel-mobility related to musical and Muslim-oriented influences in elaborately erected theoretical structures. It is found in the works of Pundarik Vitthal (1556-1605). In the beginning of his career he was employed by Burhankhan of the Farooki dynasty based in Anandavalli near Nasik in Maharashtra. Later, he left Maharashtra to enjoy patronage of Madhav Singh and Mansingh in Rajputana. Between 1556-1605 he composed three works: Sadragachandrodaya, Ragamala and Ragamanjari. Probably, the last work was penned when he was in Rajputana. In Ragamanjari he alludes to some Indian Raga-s and lists Persian Raga-s corresponding to them. Pt. Bhatkhande rightly points out that Pundarik was apparently well-acquainted with music and musicians of Northern India and specially those hailing from Delhi, Agra and surrounding areas, which were prominent seats of Hindustani music. Pt. Bhatkhande had expressed curiosity as to the reason why a learned man from Karnatak should have been asked to systematize music of the north.

The answer lies in the easy cultural circulation mentioned earlier. Mr. Hulguru Krishnammacharya has suggested a slightly different reason, though with a similar thrust. He states that Pundarik, a Kannadiga, a person speaking Kannada, hailing from Karnataka had to move out of the Vijayanagar-fold because, Ramaraja, who was ruling at the time, was partial to Telugu-speakers as the king himself hailed from Andhrapradesh. Though the argument hints at linguistic chauvinism, it also emphasizes the comparative facility of cultural circulation. Muslim influence took

deep roots in Indian music, - I submit that irrespective of the political mapping involved.

After a slight detour, we should come back to the listing of cultural factors which need to be appreciated while discussing Muslim cultural role in India.

- Artisans employed in the royal Karkhana-s were among the best. It is to be noted that only a few craftsmen had migrated from the neighbouring countries during the 13th century. Local artisans/ craftsmen were either Islamized or had been enslaved. Some, working independently helped developing urban industries especially the provincial ones because during the Mughal period many former towns lost importance as administrative centers of provincial dynasties. They were then reduced to the status of manufacturing towns.
- Because of their converted status and their dependence on government patronage, Indian artisans could not organize themselves into guilds or Futuwwa (chivalric orders) as did the Turkish or the Iranian. They were eventually treated as Hindu castes. There was however more mobility and less endogamy. Hence, by the 18-19th century artisan groups were claiming foreign ancestry. For example, water carriers Abbasi, claimed descent from Mohammed's uncle Abbas, barbers Salmani-s from Salman Farsi, a companion of the Prophet, weavers were Ansari-s or descendents from Mohammed's supporters at Median. Other artisans followed suit.

As hinted earlier, happenings at the Muslim courts and regions under their rule in the Southern parts of the country must be considered to know the fuller story of formation as well as flourishing of Hindustani art music. An illustrative example is of Ibrahim Adilshah (II) of Bijapur.

Kitab-e-navras of Ibrahim Adil Shah (II) (1580-1626)[32]

Kitab-e-Navras of Ibrahim Adil Shah II of Bijapur is a good example. This work is of special interest and importance because the monarch himself was keenly inclined towards Hindu traditions of the Deccan. Many facts from, and acts in, his rule are praised as plausible attempts to bring about fusion of Deccan and foreign cultural traditions. The work fairly mirrors, a confrontation between musical traditions already flourishing in the South, and the one, which was taking shape under Muslim influence. In this respect some features of the work are worth noting.

For instance, it has musical compositions with three parts i.e. structures representing a mid-way stage between the ancient four-part compositions and the present-day Khayal etc. which has two parts. Further, some of the compositions are entirely couched in Raga-s of Persian origin such as Haziz, Nauroz etc. and what is significant is that the names are not Sanskritized! The work also uses technical terms

---

[32] Kitab-I-Navras, Ed. Sarmadee Shahab, Asia publishing house, Bombay, 1978.

of Persian origin as song-headings e.g. the term makam. Some more evidence is also forthcoming from another source. In the fifty-nine songs set in seventeen raga-s the composer employs a language similar to Brajbhasha, a dialect of Hindi current in the North and explored even today for Hindustani musical compositions. Ibrahim Adil Shah acquires a totally musical image when it is noted that he was the moving spirit behind the famous phenomenon of Ragamala painting.

Obviously the court-life was musical and diverse. To corroborate the argument about court-music, nearly independent from other regional varieties, one can glance through contemporary travelogues. For example, Franscois Pyrard, a Frenchman, was in India between 1601-1608. He describes dinner-time dance and music presented in the Court of Mullick, the reigning prince in Chaul (Maharashtra). As the description stands, the concerned performance seems to rival a nightclub session! It is easy to guess that various parts of India were under different cultural influences such as Mughal, Persian, Portuguese, Hindu etc. Local hues combined with these to create a complex musical web; - one strand of which was art-music. As area in which Hindustani art music has flourished included many regions with their own regional cultures. The complete story of Hindustani art music can hardly be narrated without reference to deeper and independent studies devoted to the subsumed cultural areas.

Musical Partnership in the Middle Ages

During the period, two movements intrinsically related to each other in music and temper enriched Indian culture. The Bhakti and the Sufi cultures changed the face of Indian art and especially music. In fact, it is noted that over a period, the Sufi-element joined the theory and practice of the Perso-Arabic music to form a parallelogram of forces with the Bhakti movement and the pre-medieval Indian musical traditions. A continuous interchange of influences took place for a period of nearly eight centuries to bring into being Hindustani art music - as it is understood today.

It is also to be noted that, from the tenth century onwards, in addition to the overall process of exchanges mentioned, regional orientations contributed in an increasing measure, though in varying degrees.

Therefore, music-history moved at different paces in diverse regions. The fact is better reflected in non-Sanskrit works on music as they naturally tended to pay well-deserved attention to the local, regional or Prakrit elements.

However, what needs to be presented, as a simultaneous view has to be set out in sections for the sake of convenience. Very few periods and phenomena in Indian history are so highly characterized by the paradoxical twin features of mutual influencing and multi-genesis of ideas -, as do the Middle Ages.

A broad time-chart of the Bhakti-movement would provide useful clues for further analysis.

The Bhakti-movement

1) 800 BC: The term Bhakti finds a mention in Pali literature.

2) 500 BC: Vasudeva-Dharma, the earliest manifestation of the Vaishnava Dharma (of which the Bhakti-way is a particular manifestation) emerged.

3) 300 BC: The Ekantika Dharma i.e. religion addressing itself to a single God in Shrimad Bhagvat Geeta - was the first exposition of the Bhakti-doctrine. The final crystallized version of the Geeta promoted Bhakti as an individual sentiment. The phase continued till the early years of the 10-11th century.

4) Around the same time an important fusion took place. This fusion finally proved to be the matrix of abundant rituals and festivities, which came to be associated with Krishna, the chief hero in diverse Bhakti-cults. The fusion was between Vasudeva-Dharma of the Vrishni-s, Krishna-Dharma of the Yadava-s and Gopal-Dharma of the Abhira-s which combined to create a neo-Krishna cult.

5) 400-1000 AD: In the south, 12 Alwar-s (as the Vaishnava saints were known in the south and 63 Nayanar-s (Shaiva saints in the south) caused mighty waves of devotional fervour and encompassing religious faith. These saints composed thousands of songs to convey both music and metaphysics to all strata of society. The work of the southern sects inspired Pan-Indian winds of change, later some of them directly breathed a new life in the process of Hindustani music-making as a process as well as in the corpus of genres and compositions etc. resulting there from.

The songs of the Alwar-s are collectively known as Divya-Prabandha. Compositions of the Nayanar-s are called Devar-s and as texts, thousands of them exist. They were composed in Raga-s. In Karnataka, the Shiava-s described as Veera-Shaiva-s or Lingayat-s composed recitative moulds called Vachana-s. Vaishnava-s from the same region were singers of Pada-s and were identified as Haridasa-s. Singing with a drone or a flute etc. was in vogue. This brief description of the Southern expression is intended to bring out the capacity of the Indian devotional act to create generative musical moulds.

6) 800-1300 AD: It is instructive to note that for a movement it is necessary to have strong performing and scholastic traditions. Hence, the Bhakti-surge had to have its own theoretical basis. The Alwar - inspired Bhakti was successively and inevitably consolidated and codified by influential Acharya-s over a period of centuries. Some names are:

(Rang) Nathmuni	824 AD.
Pundarikaksha	

Ramamishra	
Yamunacharya	12th Century
Ramanujacharya	1129-1220 AD
Vishnuswami	
Nimbarkacharya	
Madhvacharya	1194-1294 AD

Consolidation and codification of philosophy and thinking on the roles of arts proved an important factor in the final shaping of concerned musical traditions of art, devotional and folk categories.

7) 1300-1400 AD. As has been aptly recorded:

Bhakti had its origin in the Dravid Desha, Ramananda brought it to the north. According to some, Raghavananda is credited to have accomplished the task. Hailing from the south, he settled in Banaras at the end of the 14th century. Still others point out that Saint Namadeva of Maharashtra (1328-1408) planted the seed of Bhakti in north.

8) In its northern career, devotionalism branched off into two major continuities: one Rama-centred and the other Krishna-centred. The former had Varanasi as its base, while Vrindavan was the chief centre of the latter.

(9) 1200-1700 AD.: Over the centuries, Rama-tradition also received its own theoreticians and saint-poets. Ramanujacharya (1129-1220 AD) and Ramananda (d. 1580) were representative theoreticians, while Kabir (1512-1631) and Tulsidas (1610-1710) stand for the latter variety of propagators. While Kabir and his followers believed in Nirguna devotion, Tulsidas and those who associated with him took to Saguna devotion. In the final analysis, the Saguna way proved more conducive to performing arts in general.

10) Krishna-devotion had two sub streams serving as tributaries. They are: 1) Rudra-Sampradaya (headed by Vallabhacharya 1581-1643) and 2) Gaudiya-Sampradaya (led by Sri Chaitanya 1598-1640)

11) 1500 - to date: From the point of Hindustani Art Music, one aspect of the Vallabha sect is of unparalleled importance. The cult directly contributed to theory and practice of music. The reference is obviously to the well-known Ashtachhap/ Pushti) Haveli Sangita.

Reportedly Vallabhacharya revived an older stream of music propagated by Vishnuswami around 1250 AD. It was however Vallabhcharya's son, Goswami Vitthalnathji (1516-1698) who systematized the religio-musical procedures of the cult and ceremoniously established the eight musical Acharya-s (preceptors) in 1607-8. All eight Acharya-s, together with the main Guru-s could be said to have established a line of musical growth, which continues to contribute for the last five hundred-years or so. It has been plausibly argued that the Pushtimarga-contribution to the

Hindustani art music predates that of the Gwaliyar- king Raja Mansingh and the famous Dhrupad-s associated with him. Hence, a detailed discussion is intended at a later stage. The tabulated information about the Ashtachap composers would be adequate to justify claims made for their help in shaping Hindustani art music.

Some tabulated information is given here with a view to allow a synoptic view of the Ashtachap universe of music, music-making and the socio-cultural wholeness of the vision and specific musical contribution. Various leads provided by these tables can of course be pursued further. However, the intention is to lay down a total map for consideration as the music seems to demand that kind of mapping. The tabulation below shows: number, name, birth-year, caste, name of the initiating guru and place where based:

Sr. No	Name	Birth	Caste	Guru	Date of surrender	Residence
1	Kumbhandas	1581	Gaurava Kshatriya	Vallabhacharya	1612	Jamunavati
2	Soordasa	1591	Saraswat Brahmin	Vallabhacharya	1623	Parasouli
3	Krishnadasa	1589	Kunbi Patel	Vallabhacharya	1624	Billichhu Kund
4	Paramananddas	1606	Kanyakubja Brahmin	Vallabhacharya	1633	Surabhi Kund
5	Govindswami	1618	Sanadhya Brahmin	Vitthalnath	1648	Kadam Khandi
6	Cheetswami	1629	Mathuriya Chaubey	Vitthalnath	1648	Puchhari
7	Chaturbhujadas	1643	Gaurava	Vitthalnath	1654	Jamunavati
8	Nandadas	1646	Sanadhya Brahmin	Vitthalnath	1663	Manasi ganga

No	Name	Leela-name	Image-worship	Time allotted for Keertana
1	Kumbhandas	Arjunsakha	Govardhannatha	Rajbhog samaya
2	Soordasa	Krishnasalha	Mathuresh	Utthapana
3	Krishnadasa	Vrishabhasakha	Madanmohan	Shayana
4	Paramananddas	Toka sakha	Navneet Priya	Mangalasamaya
5	Govindswami	Shridama sakha	Dwarakadhish	Gwala samaya
6	Cheetswami	Subalasakha	Vitthalnath	Sandhya arti
7	Chaturbhujadas	Vishala Sakha	Gokulnatha	Bhoga
8	Nandadas	Bhoja Sakha	Gokulchandrama	Shringar

Sr. No	Name	Expiry	Compositions	Raga-s	Tala-s	Instruments
1	Kumbhandas	1696	4000	33	6	18
2	Soordasa	1696	-	-	42	9
3	Krishnadasa	1692	1200	42	-	-
4	Paramananddasa	1697	1400	42	20	-
5	Govindswami	1698	-	-	36	23
6	Cheetswami	1698	200	36	12	-
7	Chaturbhuja Das	1698	-	-	36	29
8	Nandadas	1696	400	36	19	-

12) 1400 onwards: A majority of regions under the sway of Hindustani Art Music (HAM) were well ahead in linguistic and literary development by the beginning of the 14th century. This is important to note because saint-poet composers-employed regional languages as music - carriers - in fact as vehicles of manifestations of all performing arts. Dingal, Braj, Avadhi, Khadi Boli and Eastern Avadhi should easily come to mind. The supra-language of music used language as a vehicle to reach social strata otherwise unexposed to art-musical conventions, strategies and stylistic modes etc.

13) It would not be an exaggeration to say that depending on the strength of regional musical resources, music in the devotional category tended to crystallize in two streams: one which was highly codified while the other less so. The former nearly merged with the prevalent art music while the latter moved closer to folk music. By and large, Keertan traditions in all regions prove to be instances of the former.

14) In relation to the HAM and the Bhakti-movement a fact needs to be emphasized. The role of song and composite presentations (those which included elements of spoken word, dance and, drama) in propagating ideas in art-music can hardly be overestimated. It is in this context that contributions of composers such as Jayadeva (later 11th), Vidyapati (1375), Chandidas (14th-15th century), Bhakta Narasimha (1416-1475) Meerabai (1555-1603) et al are important.

15) The Ashtachhap tradition influenced some other contemporaries and they too were included in the traditional corpus even though they did not form a part of the great 'eight'. A good example is of composer Dhondi. Fifty of his compositions in 16 Raga-s find place in the main body of Pushti-Sangita. Tansen too came under the influence of the cult. Raja Askaran (with 125 compositions), and Gangubai are also to be mentioned in this connection.

16) The post-Ashtachhap period of Pushti-Sangita is of equal significance in discussing HAM. Historians divide it in Shri Gokulesh period (1698-1753), Shri Hariraya period (1753 1828) and Shri Dwarakesh period (1829-1881). It is obvious that the Pushti-Stream thus traces a musical history contemporaneous with many developments in HAM such as the vogue of Dhrupad, Khayal, Tappa and dissociation of dance with music, Instrumental shifts such as the one from Pakhawaj to Tabla are to be noted.

17) Perhaps Bhakti-manifestations exemplify the last attempt to hold to traditional definitions of two of the performing arts, namely Sangita (music) and Natya (drama). While the former included singing, instrument-playing and dancing, the latter included Sangita and abhinaya in it. It is obvious that definitions of the same in modern contexts are narrower in scope.

18) The Bhakti-way remains an isolated example of a collective use of corpus, structures and stylistic features of art music.

The Arabic-Perso Music Theory

In the Indian musical environs of the medieval times, an important role was played by theoreticians' attempt to catch up with music as it was performed as also their efforts to relate to musicians who made theory of music a reality. In a dream-like or an ideal situation (-perhaps more often met in earlier times than now!), performers themselves were involved in the theorizing processes. It is obvious that theorization of the times had to meet the challenges of non-Indian music as also of music-theories of non-Indian origin. As the principle of tonal organization, which ruled over regions extending from the middle-western countries to the sub-continent was involved it was but natural that music and music-theories were engaged in also carried out a subtle exchange over a number of centuries. This is what took place in case of the Arabic-Perso music-theory, a force mentioned earlier as a member of the medieval musical parallelogram of forces.

In south India, the Mussalman-s had settled on the Western coast as early as in the 8th century and on the eastern coast in the 10th century. Apart from the coastal settlements, the influence of Mussalman-s was also felt because the Arab-s soon annexed Persia and Makran. Sindh, Multan, Gujarat, Kathiawar, and Konkan also felt their presence when the Gurjar-Pratihara-s and Pala-s ruled over Bengal, and Rashtrakuta-s held sway over Maharashtra, Southern Gujarat and parts of Karnatak. Through their accounts, Arab travellers and traders suggest that they enjoyed free access in the country. The role of the Sufi-s would naturally be a part of the Mussalman-contact with India. However, it needs a separate discussion as it formed a parallel to the Bhakti-movement considered earlier.

The easy circulation of the Mussalman-s in India is closely linked to the Arabic interest in India and things Indian. The eastern philosopher of Islam (as the Arabs were often described) carried out studies in Indian culture and music, especially because of the place of music in Sufi thinking. Some highlights could be noted.

Al-Kindi, who wrote between c. 796-873, dealt with the art of Ud-playing. He described the normal tuning i.e. Taswiyya and special tuning. More importantly, he described the Ud-scale as being made of a series of sharp and flat notes yielding 12 notes. It is interesting to note how he expounded the Doctrine of Tathir i.e. ethos, according to which music is integrated with other aspects of life through a complex series of associations. For example, the 12 Maqamat were equated with the zodiac, the four strings of the Ud with the humours, elements etc. into the macrocosmic scheme. A similar attitude is notably evident in the Sufi writings on music as also in the traditional ancient Indian musicology.

Farabi (872-950) worked out the musical sound as a mathematical perception. Important points from his theorization are:

1) He was the first to use names of the Arabic alphabets for notes of two octaves. The middle of the octave-space was the fundamental note, literally the Madhya-swara (as in medieval India).

2) Being a performing musicologist, he lucidly explained distinctions between concepts such as Saut and Naghma i.e. Nada and Swara.

3) He developed concepts of Muwalifat (melodic interval) and Istihab (harmonic interval) explaining, in the process, how the latter could be Kamil (perfect) and hence pleasant. Further, three main types of the Muwalifat were identified as Buzurg (major) Awast (middle) and Kuchak (minor).

4) Farabi discovered the musical ratios of 8:7, 28:27, and 49:48-, which were unknown to the Greeks.

5) In great detail he described instruments such as Ud, Tambur-Al-Baghdadi, Tambur-Al-Khurasani and Rabab. He also referred to Shah-Rud (which may probably be related to the Sarod in contemporary India).

6) Unlike Farabi, Ibn Sina (b.980-1037) is more critical. Once again, Ud is the basic instrument used to explain the Arabic - Perso musical theory. He is the first to designate the musical interval of 9:8 with the Sufistic term Parda. It is interesting to note that Farabi has called the same interval as Tanin, in a process of Arabicizing the Greek term Tonos! Ibn Sina treated it as a basic unit and worked out an entire musical scale of 17 intervals. Sarmadee convincingly argues in this context that the process of assimilation of two scales - the one of 17 intervals of 1/3rd tone each, and the other of basic Sapta Swara with 22 sruti-s is to be traced to the Arabic-Perso theory and practice of music.

7) It cannot be a coincidence that the epoch-making changeover from Jati to Raga-way was effected soon after Ibn Sina's experiments with Makam-s in nearby Khorasan. Some colourful tones were brought into circulation by mathematically marrying off the Parda with the aurally fixed Swara. It is significant that Ibn Sina rightly described them as Mulwwana.

8) These developments were a short distance away from the process of structural-cum-temperamental pooling of melodic resources to result into some colourful tones which brought into circulation Raga-s such as Yemen-kalyan, Husaini Kanada, Jangul-kafi etc.

9) Musical instruments inevitably played an important role as carriers of performed theory, craftsmanship and cultural information in the Arabic-Perso musical mingling with the Indian stream described here. Ibn Khurdazbin (d.912 AD), AI Masudi (d.957AD), Khwarizmi (c.976-97 AD) and Ibn Sina's disciple Ibn Zaila (d. 1048) are some the Arab authorities to be consulted in this respect. Through them we learn that Tambur was also known as Barbat. It was conjectured that Kiran was a metathesis of Kinar or Kinnar (= Hebrew Kinnor, Indian Kinnari). The Barbat

became Bar Bitos (Barbiton) for the Greeks and Ud for the Arabs because the belly of the instrument was made of wood. Ibn Sina considered Barbat and Ud as synonymous and referred to Rabab and Nay-al-Iraqui as other instruments in vogue. Rabab was a near-national instrument in Khorasan which was the medieval cultural center rivaling India. By the time of Amir Khusro, Rabab was well established in India. During the Mughal period it had become so reputable that Tansen's Senia Gharana was at one time described as Rababiya.

To begin with, the instrument had four strings. With its advent in India, two side-strings were added to. By the 17th century it had 17-18 strings. Amir Khusro has also referred to a plectrum-played variety of it. Capt. Willard confirmed this though, at the dawn of the century, Popley found it played with a horsehair bow. We would do well to remember that a single instrument would seldom thrive by itself. Acceptance of an instrument usually symptomizes acceptance of a particular timbre. This is borne out by the fact that Kamanchas, Ghichaks, Sarinda-s, Bengal-Sarangi-s and Sarangi-s - all participated in the music of the Rabab -type. Little later, would be the occasion to discuss Amir Khusro vis-à-vis Indian music. At this point however, it is instructive to refer to one of his poetic descriptions of the Rabab-sound in order to explain Ibn Sina's contribution to the Perso-Arabic music and music-theory. Referring to the soothing, exciting, attractive and invigorating resonance, he notes figuratively, "they feel its pulse when it is in full health, and they put up Parda-s for it, although it is never covered or concealed!" Obviously there is a pun (paronomaia) in the use of the term Parda-s. The point is that even though no concealment or covering up (Purdah) was employed, they employed a playing technique, which concealed the note actually played! One needs to go back to Ibn Sina's relevant statement to understand the reference. As translated by Sarmadee, the statement reads, "And that is connected with this chapter the Tarkibat and they are produced by means of one beat, which continues upon two strings the note sought and that which is along with it on the fourth (4/3) or fifth (3/2), and other than these, these two were falling in one time... and the Tazifat, and you know them and they are included under the Tarkibat, except that they are in the octave". Stating that Tarkib was originally one of the schemes of Talif-ul-luhun or composition of melodies, Dr. Farmer remarks, "One thing is certain, and that is that Ibn Sina unmistakably describes the performance of the simultaneous consonances of the fourth, fifth and the octave."

To sum up, it is safe to say that inter-relationships known as Shadja-Panchama, Shadja-Madhyama and Shadja-Ashtama, swara, so important to Hindustani music as the basic melody-generating principles, were probably brought into circulation with the help of the bowed type of Rabab. This instrument could gain easy acceptance in the land of Vina-s - the fretless melody-makers of the pre-Brihaddeshi days.

It is clear that the establishment of the drone-principle or more precisely, the principle of the fundamental note - is closely related to Raga-s as contrasted with

Jati-s. Recognition accorded to the three relationships as Bhava-s made many significant processes possible. For example, transition from the Nibaddha to the Anibaddha phase, accommodation of the basic extension formulae of Murchana-s within one octave space in order to convert them into principles of Raga elaboration (i.e. pattern-elaboration), establishment of the Swarashtaka in place of Swara-saptaka as the frame in which to place all intervals in a hierarchy of pitch- could be identified as consequences directly flowing from the three Bhava-s 'accorded the status of recurring phenomena as mentioned earlier. The use of frets on the Vina around the 8th century suggests use of Bhava-s on a firmer footing and a definite movement towards melodic (as opposed to polyphonic/ harmonic), solo as contrasted with a collective manifestation of music and Raga as distinct from the Jati-way of making music.

The Arabic-Perso music and music-theory related to it became a part of the Indian musical behaviour, not because of the political ascendancy or conquests, but because of the inevitable exchange of ideas between people who followed diverse performing traditions. Obviously, the concerned cultural groups were endowed with a spirit of curiosity, sense of wonder and thirst for experimentation. These conditions practically extended the boundaries of the Indian subcontinent to include Persia, Afghanistan etc. to form a wider cultural zone.

State, Religion and Music

In India, as in many other major cultures, Religion and State exerted mutual influence and tensions. On the Indian scene there is a paradox to be witnessed: we have instances of the secular function of religion as well as an a-political stance of State! Both Saints and Sufis in India provide evidence. As has been frequently pointed out, the Sufi-s often preceded the Muslim conquerors. The conquerors often wooed the Sufi-s whose independent and deep hold over the people made them weighty political assets. Rich Sufi-s were also not rare. It is however necessary to remember that Sufi-saints i.e. the pir-s are to be distinguished from their followers. The latter were, and are, likely to be ordinary human beings with ordinary worldly wants and cravings, who, however subscribed to the unworldly Sufi - model as an ideal. The situation thus obtained was, in fact, common to all other faiths in India. What is pertinent while discussing any religious faith in relation to music in India is the scope the faith intrinsically offers to music and the kind of support it gives to music-related or music-generated activities. This is where Sufi-s and Bhakti cults are seen to operate on parallel lines. Their common target or base was minds of the people. Both arrived on the scene when Hinduism was once again gaining ascendance after centuries of Buddhist sway. Both had learnt their lessons from careers of the earlier faiths. For example, they were convinced about the use of regional languages, adoption of an accommodative stance towards lower social strata, desirability of stressing the importance of compassion, affection and other passions of the heart; effectiveness of formulation of collective rituals and affording

scope to ecstasy-arousing use of multiple sense-modalities were some of the common planks explored.

The Sufi-s in India[33]

A number of authorities have pointed out that the Sufi-s were present in the South of India earlier than in the North. However, in view of the limited brief of the present inquiry, it would be sufficient to focus attention on the area covered by Hindustani art music.

The first notable Sufi arrival and not a visit in the company of a conqueror was that of Sheik Abul Hasan ali Bin Usman al-Hujwiri al-Jullabi al-Ghaznavi, popularly known as Data Ganj Baksh (d. 1072/79). The name proclaims the long stay of the family in Hujwir and Jullab - the two quarters of the city of Ghazni. As it was customary for early Sufi Sheiks he travelled widely after completing his studies. The travels took him to Syria, Iraq, Iran, Azerbaijan, Tabiristan, Khuzistan, Kirman and Transoxania. Expectably, he met several prominent Sufis of the time. In Khorasan alone he is reported to have met 300 Sufi-s. His travels lasted for about 40 years. On orders of his Pir he came to Lahore as a successor to Sheik Hussein Zanjani. This was the time when Ghaznavid Empire was falling apart, the Seljuks had erupted and the Hindu-s were stiffening their resistance. Hujwiri had to leave Ghazni under difficult circumstances - even leaving his books behind. He reached Lahore at night and found to his dismay that Sheik Zanjani had died only the previous day!

Not much is known about his life in Lahore, though it appears that he did not find the city congenial. Somewhere between 1177-96 he completed Kashf-ul-Mahjab - his theoretical volume on Sufism. It has been noted that he came to be popularly known as Data Ganj Baksh, "The Master who bestows treasures" even in his life-time. Hazrat Muin-ud-din Chishti stayed with him and performed a Chilla.

Data Ganj Baksh's coming to Lahore is characteristic of an organized religion keen on putting in conscious efforts to preserve and propagate a conceptual, philosophical and behavioural position in respect of all areas of human life. Data Ganj Baksh belonged to the Juniad order of the Sufi-s. Al Junaid of Baghdad was the founder of the Silsila, as the Sufi orders are known. He is responsible for the development of the doctrine of Fana (passing away in God); the doctrine which was originally propounded by Abu Yazid (Bayazid) of Bistam (d.875). The doctrine, which assumed central position in the later Sufi theory, has obvious artistic allusions. Al Hujwiri noted that there were 12 distinct Silsila-s in his times. Abul Fazl mentioned 17 in the sixteenth century. Prof. Sh. Abdur Rasihd, the author of Hujwiri-s biography, noted in 1967, "at present the number has exceeded 176." In India the

---

[33] The Memoirs of Sufi-s Written in India, Siddiqui Mahmud- Hussai M.S. University, Baroda, 1979, p.48.

most popular Silsila-s have been the Chishti, Surhawardi, Naqshabandi and Qadir. However, as the first major Sufi in India, Al Hujwiri needs a little more attention.

Kashf-ul-Majhab is highly regarded as the first important Persian work on Sufism. Dara Shukoh as well as Hazrat Nizamuddin Aulia spoke about it with great respect. The latter is reported to have observed, "If a person who has no spiritual guide studies this book he gets a Pir". Divided into 25 chapters following the question-answer format, Al Hujwiri dwells on themes such as Knowledge, Poverty, Sufism, Patched Frocks (the symbolic Sufi dress), Imams, Different doctrines of the Sufi orders etc. He also touches on the unification with God (Tauhid), faith (Iman), purification (Tahart), repentance (Tauba).

The last chapter deals with the controversial question of Sama (audition) and music. As a very early clear statement of a Sufi who breathed his last in India, and who has continued to draw devotees through the centuries, it is instructive to note what he says, "I... think it more desirable that beginners should not be allowed to attend musical concerts (Sama), lest their natures became depraved. These concerts are extremely dangerous and corrupting, because women on the roofs or elsewhere look at the Dervish-s who are engaged in audition; and in consequence of this the auditors have great obstacles to encounter. Or it may happen that a young reprobate is one of the party, since some ignorant Sufi-s have made a religion of all this and have flung truth to the winds".

The genesis of Al Hujwiri's anti-music stance is clear in his frank account of his fondness for it in youth. He relates how Abu Ahmed Al Muzaffar Bin Humdum asked a tired-looking Al Hujwiri what the latter wanted. "I replied that I wished to hear some music (Sama). He immediately sent for a Qawwal and a number of musicians. Being young and enthusiastic and filled with the ardour of a novice, I became deeply agitated as the strains of music fell on my ears. After a while, when my transport subsided, he asked me how I liked it. I told him that I had enjoyed it very much. He answered, "A time will come when this music will be no more to you than the croaking of a raven. The influence of music lasts so long as there is no contemplation, and as soon as contemplation is attained music has no power. Take care not to accustom yourself to this, lest it grows part of your nature and keep you back from higher things".

Al Hujwiri does not list the four Sufi Silsila-s more popular in India. It is opined that the Junaid-s could not muster adequate organizational powers to become a major order in India. Is it possible that Al Hujwiri's warnings against music and the Chishti's or other orders' reliance on music contributed to the Junaid's weak presence? One may leave it at that!

I leave the discussion here! Not because the story of Hindustani music is complete, - in fact it might be said to have begun at this point. However, my limited brief has been to outline considerations essential for taking a new look at the history of Hindustani art music.

Perhaps what I have put down is more historio-graphical than historical. It may appear to be a sketchy attempt to suggest ways of approaching the problem of writing a more meaningful history of music. Anyway, to study and comment on History's own past can also be a fascinating exercise - I certainly found it so!